

Having now given our views on the missions of the future AKU, we are ready to bring together our ideas on ways AKU may faithfully pursue its missions. We are guided by our vision of what AKU must become to be a distinguished university for the Muslim and developing worlds. We relate what we propose to needs we perceive, and we seek to be realistic about the scale of activity AKU can attain. But we have not dropped or cut back on ideas simply because we foresee they will be difficult to finance and carry through. AKU in 2020 or 2025 may not have solidly established all the components we here recommend; some may have pressed ahead of others that have lagged in delays or postponements. But we would be disappointed if our proposals were regarded only as a list of possible developments from which selection can be made from time to time, as opportunity or enthusiasm dictates. We have tried to conceive a vision of a future AKU that will be active in several fields in different geographic locations, but that will do so in a coherent design suited to the missions and responsibilities it has assumed. This and following parts of the Report will be concerned with the balance between AKU's future components, their complementarities, and (in Section IX) the sequence in which we think they should be developed.

Some of the characteristics we believe AKU must have to be a distinguished university must pervade and link all its various faculties and institutes. Ones we particularly stress are :

(1) **a full utilisation of the potentials of modern communications and information handling**, to assure coherence and effectiveness in a university spread over different parts of the world, some of which tend to be poorly connected to modern "information highways";

(2) **efforts to use modern technology and understanding of learning processes to develop superior educational methods** throughout the University;

(3) **a vigorous continuation in all its components of the University's commitment to improving the professional opportunities and status of women and understanding of their outlook, situation and problems in contemporary societies.**

---

The possible components we are proposing for the future AKU and discuss in this section of our Report are several. For convenience of reference we list here the headings under which they appear later in this Section of our report :

- 1 The Faculty of Health Sciences. Continuing Emphases and New Future Elements.
- 2 The Future of IED and Education in AKU.
- 3 An Institute of Islamic Civilisations.
- 4 An Institute of Human Development.
- 5 An Institute of Economic Growth and Society.
- 6 An Institute of Planning and Management of Human Settlements.
- 7 A Faculty or College of Arts and Sciences.
- 8 Other fields or components considered.

The terminology we have used to describe these various components deserves some explanation. The term "Institute" occurs several times, "Faculty" more sparingly, and "College" once, as an alternative. (It may also be noted that the term "School" does not occur, though AKU already has a "School of Nursing".) Our reason for favouring the use of the term "Institute" resides principally in its flexible meaning. We have been faithful to the vision of the future AKU as not being a conventional university with the familiar structure of faculties and schools. We have wanted to see it engaged in a number of important subjects in ways that would be distinctive, innovative and not massive. The word "Institute" has seemed best to indicate our conceptions : it has a long and respected usage for research and graduate education units within and outside universities; it is widely used for institutions engaged in teaching (like AKU's IED), consulting or service activities. The various "Institutes" we recommend would have these functions in various combinations. The word "Faculty", with its European roots, suggests a focus on degree-granting programmes based on a related group of established disciplines, as AKU has in its Faculty of Health Sciences, and as universities around the world have in their professional faculties and their Faculties of Arts and Sciences. Some of the "Institutes" we are recommending would not have the granting of degrees as their principal function; and they would involve combinations of disciplines

which cross over the normal groupings in academic faculties - a characteristic we think may be necessary to their distinctiveness and creativity. Our label, "A Faculty or College of Arts and Sciences" is intended, in contrast, to emphasise that this would be primarily a teaching, degree-granting component of AKU, with the word "College" added as a way of emphasising its focus on first-degree higher education in the fashion of the American liberal arts college.

We do not insist on the terms we have used but we hope we will in the following parts of Section VII make clear why we have chosen them. We do not relish logomachies and complaisantly anticipate that our successors in the planning of AKU may come to favour different labels for the components we are recommending, though we naturally hope that our substantive conceptions of what they may achieve will survive.

---

## **B *Some Pervasive Characteristics of a Distinguished AKU***

### **1 *A University on the "Information Superhighways" of the World.***

The spectacular progress of modern communications and information handling have opened prospects of both exciting opportunities and corrosive frustrations. They make it possible for students and scholars in remote places to seek out information and instruction from distant spots that they could not hope to visit. They make researchers able to keep abreast of rapidly developing fields even when they are far from the leading centres in their fields. But they bring challenges too; those who do not or cannot grasp these new powers risk falling farther than ever behind those who can use them. As the director of the Aspen Institute's Communications and Society Programme remarked not long ago, "These technologies could bridge the gap between the rich and the poor, and they could also, I'm afraid, widen that gap". [Quoted in Gary Stix, "Domesticating Cyberspace", *Scientific American*, August, 1993, p.110]

The developing countries have been particularly afflicted by their distance and isolation from centres of learning. The publications and travel that could keep them abreast of the frontiers of research and scholarship have been costly and too

often skimpily provided. The advent of powerful electronic transmission of information is thus particularly promising for universities in these countries. There is, for many purposes, no electronic marvel that can substitute for direct human contact (even the face-to-face contacts of video-conferencing lack the serendipitous effects of being together), and we think it important that AKU maintain travel budgets that will enable its staff to mount the airplanes for distant campuses and laboratories when they need to. But the surrogates for travel multiply as cyberspace expands and there are few needs before AKU more urgent than being able to exploit them.

The rapidity of the revolutions in information and communication is vividly apparent when one remembers that when AKU was starting just a decade ago, computing technologies were only beginning their migration from mainframe data centres to office desktops. Universities that had little beyond computation centres have had their campuses "wired" within and intricately linked to the world outside. In 1983, the Harvard Committee had journalism and information on its agenda, but it gave no special attention to the electronic potential that would loom shortly thereafter. By 1993 when there were 1.7 million computers in more than 125 countries on the Internet alone, it was impossible for the Chancellor's Commission to ignore the potentials that had come before AKU. And a summer 1994 survey showing that number to have grown in a year to 3.2 million computers has spurred our attention further.<sup>11</sup>

The educational and research potentials of these new powers can be illustrated by some recent testimonials on the uses of Internet: a blind student tells of tracking down archives of William Shakespeare's works that could be read on his speech synthesiser; an elementary school teacher in Las Vegas used electronic mail from an Australian graduate student working in Antarctica to show his third-grade class what it was like to live and work there; a New Jersey teacher had his word-processing class send "get well" messages via Internet to 40 Russian students from the Chernobyl area who were visiting a health spa in England; a concerned parent of a daughter with a spinal problem searched multiple data bases and bibliographies to find physicians who knew how to diagnose and treat the problem. [These examples from the Gary Stix article cited above.]

In late 1992 a member of this Commission, Vartan Gregorian, gave the keynote address at a conference on "Technology, Scholarship, and the Humanities: The Implications of Electronic Information", sponsored by the American Council of Learned Societies, the Research Libraries Group, and others. [Summary of Proceedings, distributed by ACLS, 1993.] As a university president and former director of the New York Public Library, Gregorian spoke of a revolution, with total collected amounts of information doubling every four years, and universities subject not only to the "daunting arrival" of books and journals but now to an "electronic torrent from thousands of data bases around the world". The problems that afflict universities and research libraries everywhere must be faced by new universities like AKU in the spirit that is now forced upon older universities. Individual universities need to make themselves part of wider enterprises, national and international in scope. As a vice-president of Carnegie Mellon University remarked at the same conference:

*"The university library is declining in importance relative to other information services. Any college, department or individual can mount its own information on computers, thus becoming part of a national electronic library service - in effect, an open library."*

Translating this vision to the circumstances of AKU, we can foresee a complex network of information resources in which the branches of AKU in different countries are interconnected among themselves, while departments, research units, and individual teachers and scholars are linked outside AKU to whatever they particularly need, wherever it may be in the world.

The planning and development of such a "wiring" of AKU internally and externally will certainly be a formidable undertaking, requiring ample resources and years of effort. The available technology will be changing and cheapening at dizzying speeds, though some of it will bring disappointingly slow results (our Carnegie Mellon man finds that "electronic libraries are far more modest than the bold projections of the 1980s would have led many to expect. They are typically small, expensive and difficult to use."). Sound initiatives will require much study of experience elsewhere, consultation with experts, and in the end prudent judgements. The Commission

<sup>11</sup> The 1993 figure is from Stix, *op. cit.*; the new figure reported in *New York Times*, August 10, 1994, p.D1. The *Times* article disputes the common assertion that there are now 20 to 30 million users of the Internet but not its vertiginous growth.

---

believes that, when and if its proposals on the long-term development of AKU are accepted, a **task force should be set up to consider what the implications in information and communication needs may be.** We recognise of course that the University already has a committee for planning for information resources, but we think that an expanded effort in wider and longer-term perspectives follows logically from the exercise of this Commission. And we further believe that, just as universities now have librarians and directors of computer and information services, AKU in future will need a high level officer overseeing the complexities of its communications and information resources.

## 2 *A University Using Superior Educational Techniques*

The unfolding of new possibilities of learning through the advances of our time has impressed the Commission and made us want to see AKU take full advantage of them. These advances are in part a consequence of technology, as we have illustrated, but they also have come from the study of learning processes by cognitive psychologists and educators. In discussing globalisation earlier, we have noted the remarkable diffusion of radio, cinema and television that has brought MTV and things more evidently beneficial to places as remote as Hunza. The students who will come to AKU in future decades will undoubtedly be even more accustomed to learning from sounds and images than this year's students are. They will have been to school with teachers who have had similar learning experiences, who are more alert and better educated than teachers are now; and they will have had better chances to manipulate calculators and other electronic devices. The rapid urbanisation and the globalisation of the world will have brought more and more of these students - even ones from very disadvantaged backgrounds - into enlivening and sophisticating influences that prepare them for better learning in the University.

**The utilisation of computer and communications technologies must be an important part of AKU's strategy for superior learning.** There is an abundance of experience, as illustrated in the anecdotes we have reported on Internet use, to stimulate and guide AKU's ventures. The infatuation of the United States with computers and networks has produced "wired" campuses at

pioneering institutions like Dartmouth and Carnegie Mellon, and many others (including Harvard) are hastening to emulate them. The elite colleges and universities equip student's rooms with special telephone jacks for computer modems, but they are not alone in assuming that all students will have access to a computer. (It is a common requirement, even in "shirtsleeve" colleges, that papers be prepared on computers, with even the word-processing software sometimes specified.) The investments are not trivial (and constant reaching for increased power moderates the cheapening of equipment) and much thought is being exercised on optimal uses and on coping with unintended effects. President Shapiro writes with unaccustomed jargon about developing an "interactive software environment" at Princeton; and as "artsy" a college as Bennington is going to have a New Media Centre in co-operation with Apple and other manufacturers; its new plan for the College's future declares that "Students will assemble an ongoing electronic portfolio of their work at the College on CD-ROM as a requirement for graduation, assuring multimedia literacy of all Bennington graduates". [*Symposium Report of the Bennington College Board of Trustees, 1994, p.30*] We also read that there is faculty resistance and doubt about the beneficence of "wired" campuses, the flood of e-mail questions they bring, and some of the educational effects. [Cf. *The Economist*, "Harvard Wired", February 5, 1994, p.87]

AKU will have to assess what it should imitate and what it should avoid in this burgeoning set of experiences. And it should be sure to keep educational purposes and results, not mere technical chic, as its dominant concerns. Learning experiences using modern computer technologies are certainly different from those using more traditional means; the opportunities for students to work by themselves, getting impersonal and confidential guidance, rather than the more public, and sometimes humiliating, experience of the classroom has been seen to offer new learning potential for students at levels from basic literacy to the very advanced. Modems and networks also make it possible for students to work together, out of direct contact with the professors, to the discomfort of some of the latter. Many classic educational questions are given new forms by these developments; for example, the old surmise that students learn more from one another and motivate one another better than their professors

is rising again as students pass their work over the wires to one another. A new intensity of learning may come about on the campus. But the means that make this learning possible also are full of potentials for drawing in resources from all over the world. We have argued in preceding paragraphs that AKU as an institution must be on the "information superhighways" of the world. This must mean in practice that all of its members - faculty, researchers, administrators, and students as well - will regularly be reaching out to wherever the most critical aids for their work may be found. Students, in doing so, will be preparing for futures in which distinction in their careers will require such habits and skills.

Members of the Commission stressed the enormous need for improved teaching and learning in the universities of the developing and Muslim worlds. The need poses the challenge to AKU to : (a) become a model of excellence in teaching and learning, and (b) to help replicate its successes to others through training and research. We have been impressed at the progress that has been made in developing "learning to learn" programmes, based on the work of people such as Georgi Lozanov, Howard Gardner, Paul McLean, Arthur Costa, Noel Entwistle and others. The views have been expressed in the Commission that AKU should develop a Unit to deal with Teaching-Learning Effectiveness or that IED, as it develops, should broaden its concerns with better ways of teaching and learning in the schools to promoting them in all that AKU does in its various branches. We can commend these views without absolving the faculty who are not professionals of education from continuing attention to methods and techniques that will make AKU distinctive not only in what students learn but in how they learn. **We think this so universal a responsibility of the staff that it cannot be left to any special body to foster; it is for everyone to attend to.**

### 3 *A University Devoted to Advancing the Status and Professional Opportunities of Women*

In our reconsideration of the mission of AKU in Section VI above we have strongly affirmed its need to preserve openness, both intellectually and in its receptivity to the diversity of humankind, regardless of race, creed, or sex. From its beginnings, and indeed in continuation

of the principles set by the 48th Imam, AKU has been distinguished by a special concern for the status and professional advancement of women. The establishment of the School of Nursing has served that purpose and contributed strongly to the present situation where AKUMC has more than half women among its students and faculty. And similarly, one of the aims of IED is to improve the opportunities and status of women in the teaching profession.

Neither the Chancellor nor AKU's present faculty and staff needs special urging from this Commission to continue and expand the University's commitment to advancing the welfare and opportunities of women. The Chancellor's views have been strongly and publicly expressed and we have been impressed in our meetings with the faculty and staff in Karachi by their vigorous commitment to these purposes. **Our Commission is happy to affirm its support of this basic AKU commitment and its belief that it should be generalised as the University grows into new fields and branches.**

How AKU's commitment to the status and advancement of women will be concretely expressed in the future will in part follow straightforwardly from its established principles; avoiding discrimination by sex in all its work, it will favour programmes and projects that offer special benefits and opportunities for women. What can be done will depend on the strengths AKU may come to have in different regions and in the fields it develops.

AKU's beginnings in the health sciences and education equip it to provide example and knowledge in addressing women's needs that are particularly severe in the South Asian sub-continent. This is a region that has long been unhappily distinguished by life-expectancies for females that were, until quite recently, smaller than those for men, in contrast to the pattern elsewhere in the world. The implication in these statistics that women over much of the sub-continent, and certainly in its Muslim areas, have suffered conditions unfavourable for their health has been confirmed by studies showing larger percentages of girls than boys being malnourished and ill-provided. **The case for a Faculty of Health Sciences based in Karachi giving special attention to women's health is clearly implied.**

An abundance of studies in recent years has shown strong correlation between the education of women and improvements in the health of children - and indeed, of whole families. The World Bank in its 1993 World Development Report displayed in characteristically numerical terms [pp.42-43] for governments that would listen how much more girl's than boy's education would do to improve children's health. Such figures point a finger at the costliness of the neglect of girl's education over most of the sub-continent. We have noted earlier how poorly Pakistan shows on the UN's Human Development Index, notably because of high illiteracy, which still stands at more than 75% for women in the country (as it does in Bangladesh as well). Correspondingly, Pakistan shows badly in its (1991) ratio of only 52 girls for every 100 boys in primary school, whereas similarly poor or poorer countries like Kenya and Tanzania had 95 or 98. The table (# 29) in the 1994 World Development Report from which these numbers are drawn shows impressive improvements since 1970 for Pakistan and other countries. But the remaining disparities suggest a special mission for AKU. **Whether for its effects on health, or for the myriad other benefits education brings to women, AKU's present location gives it strong reason to focus its educational efforts particularly on girls and women.**

The forms AKU's efforts on behalf of women's health and education may take are numerous, and forecasting them in detail would be no proper task for this Commission. One of the papers we received from the faculty proposed community-based development projects for women and "special attention to the needs of the girl child". We can agree with these proposals but, remembering that AKU will remain a small institution dealing with vast problems, we must emphasise that what it does must, through its quality, example, and careful research, reach beyond the people it can directly help.

As the new components of AKU we are recommending in later parts of this report come into being, the University's potentials in serving the needs of women in the developing and Muslim worlds will multiply. The Institute of Human Development that we are recommending (Section VII C.4. below) should greatly strengthen AKU's

capacity to deepen and spread understanding of the importance of better care for young girls. One of the principal foci of this Institute will be on the lasting consequences through the life cycle of deprivations children may experience. Many of these are still poorly understood or not widely appreciated and we believe the work AKU can do in elucidating them can affect policies that will bring better lives to large numbers of women.

Similarly, the work we project for AKU on economic growth (Section VII C.5. below) will address economic questions affecting women's opportunities and well-being very basically. In particular, it may contribute to advancing or preserving women's employment opportunities on a much broader front than would otherwise be possible for the University. We think, for example, of problems such as Egypt has encountered in cutting back from the bloated state employment of Nasser's time. In the 1950s and 1960s there was a vigorous growth of educational and employment opportunities for women but subsequently, in the chronic dearth of employment that Egypt has suffered since the 1970s, women have been affected disproportionately. In 1986 the unemployment rate is said to have been 10% for men but 40.7% for women; and it is perhaps of particular interest to us that of the women seeking to join the labour force, 40% were university graduates. [Mervat F. Hatem, "The Paradoxes of State Feminism in Egypt, p.232 in eds. Barbara J. Nelson and Najma Chowdhury, Women and Politics World-wide, Yale, 1994.] The problems of equitable access to employment for women are obviously especially hard to resolve where economic growth is slow and employment chronically limited. Anything AKU's research and instruction on economic growth may do to raise the rate of growth may contribute more than proportionately to increasing the opportunities for women. It may also help protect the legitimacy of women's aspiration to have careers of their own. In Egypt, the bitter competition for jobs has apparently brought a critical reaction against the view that women should normally aspire to occupational careers, and this reaction has probably contributed to the rising popularity of Islamist views that the proper place of women is in the home.

The ways in which future new components of AKU will contribute in the common commitment of the University to the advancement of women will differ appreciably, as we have begun to illustrate. We have thus far mostly been concerned with professional education and research. As we now turn to liberal education and the study of Islamic civilisations as future developments in AKU, we encounter somewhat different needs and possibilities. In Section VI of this report we have foreshadowed recommendations on general or liberal education in AKU that are more fully developed later in this Section VII. We are recommending that AKU broaden the education of its own students to equip them more satisfactorily to adjust to the complex demands of modern life and to assume the positions of leadership we hope AKU graduates, both men and women, will assume. And in the aspiration to wider influence that we urge on AKU, we stress that it should provide models and materials that will attract attention and use far beyond AKU itself.

It should be axiomatic that the situation and the outlook of women must be an important part of general or liberal education in the modern world, for the need and the mutual benefit of both the sexes. If the principle is axiomatic, its concrete curricular application is, however, subject to many options and has aroused controversy in many places. The Commission has had recommendations from the faculty in Karachi for the establishment of women's studies in AKU. We agree warmly with this recommendation in principle and we are aware that accepting it requires steps beyond the traditional content of liberal education. It is, of course, our hope and expectation that the liberal education that develops in AKU, first perhaps in broadening the education in the Faculty of Health Sciences, and ultimately issuing in a Faculty of Arts and Sciences, will be original in many respects. In dealing with the history and the structure of the modern world, for example, we think it should go beyond narratives of kings and statesmen, constitutions, generals and wars, to give some understanding of the peoples of the world, their passions and diversity. Among these understandings must certainly be that of women's outlooks. It would seem important, for example, for students not simply to know how South Asia (including Sri Lanka) has come to have so many women as heads of government, but what women

think about this fact; and moreover, what they think about the reserved parliamentary seats for women and the dearth of elected members. (The chapter on Bangladesh by Najma Chowdhury in the volume cited above that she edited, is quite illuminating on these particular matters.)

The fact that AKU is a Muslim university has basic implications for the character of the liberal education that may develop within it. We conceive the Institute of Islamic Civilisations that we are recommending as having important educational and research functions that we trust will infuse AKU's own programmes. This Institute must obviously be concerned with research and scholarship on the status and position of women both in the Islamic heritage and in present-day conditions in the Muslim countries. We hardly need emphasise the delicacy and controversiality of such matters at the present time. But we do think it important that AKU enable the status and situation of women both in Muslim countries and elsewhere to be studied and appreciated in more rounded and less sensational terms than they frequently appear in the news media or in the pronouncements of extremists. We do not suppose that AKU will soon or easily venture into such brave interpretations of Islamic traditions as a participant in the discussions of this Commission, the Moroccan professor and writer, Fatima Mernissi, has in her book *The Veil and the Male Elite*<sup>12</sup>. But we are confident that there is a large scope for research and writing on women that will bring valuable contributions from AKU for the benefit of Muslims and the world at large.

Developing studies related to women in AKU clearly should be a diffuse enterprise for which many people will have to share responsibilities. We are of course aware that women's studies have in recent decades expanded enormously, winning special sections in university press catalogues and special issues of learned publications [cf., e.g., the issue devoted to women's studies of the *Times Literary Supplement*, June 3, 1994]. They have in some universities won departmental or other organisational status. At this stage of AKU's development we do not think women's studies should be given a special programme or organisational status; such a move might be compartmentalising and damage the pervasive concern with women's needs and advancement that we think AKU should have.

<sup>12</sup> This is the title of the English translation (Addison-Wesley Publishing, 1991) of her book originally published in 1987 in French as *Le harem politique*. Her text is faithful to the English sub-title: "A Feminist Interpretation of Women's Rights in Islam".

---

On the other hand, we do think it important that there be a definite locus of responsibility for stimulating and monitoring progress toward this purpose of the University. There is a strong concern among many of the present faculty in Karachi to move toward strengthened attention to women's needs and into women's studies within the University as it now exists. We think it desirable that there be a prompt response to this concern with assignment of responsibility and the allocation of modest means for planning and exploration. It has been suggested in our discussions that an officer on the staff of the chief academic officer have special and continuing responsibility for these matters, and furthermore, that this officer be supported by a committee or planning group. We believe these to be sound suggestions and that the need for such planning and oversight will grow and evolve as the University spreads into new fields and components. We do not think we can wisely prescribe the specific organisational arrangements that will be needed in the near or longer run future, but urge that the senior administration and the Board of Trustees give early and continuing attention to them.

---

## C *Components for the Future AKU*

### C.1 *The Faculty of Health Sciences : Continuing Emphases and New Elements*

I.1 The Commission has assumed that the future AKU will continue with a strong commitment to the health sciences and that the Faculty of Health Sciences will continue as a major part of the University. The questions the Commission has needed to face are several :

- What changes in the needs and demands for health care will appear in the coming quarter-century and what changes in the capabilities and practice of medicine and health care will come about ?

- What changes, if any, in the character and emphases of the existing Faculty should be made ? What additions to its present scope ?

- And how might AKU's work in the Health Sciences be strengthened and complemented by new components of the University ?

In considering such questions we have benefited from the Strategic Planning Exercise now going on in the Faculty. We have also studied closely the report of the Medical Centre Committee and related our recommendations to theirs. But we are taking a longer perspective and, being concerned with many fields, have not been able to concentrate our attention on the health field as MCC did. Our views are necessarily less fully worked out, but we hope they may provide helpful basic guidance in the future shaping of AKU's work in this field.

I.2 There are perhaps no subjects of private and public concern that arouse more interest and debate at the present time than health and health care. And there is reason to believe that the crises of public policy that now preoccupy the United States, or scandalise Italy, or bring forth a World Bank Development Report trying to teach many governments the principles of sound health policy, are not transitory but becoming more and more world-wide. **Future efforts to cope with new needs and demands, and to respond to new scientific and technical advances, may be more exacting in the health field than in others that governments and private institutions must face. It may indeed be more difficult than in other fields simply to foresee the situations AKU and other institutions may face a quarter of a century from now.**

I.3 We do not venture into a thorough analysis of why health and health policy should now be such daunting subjects. But one evident source is the growing and potentially unlimited demand for health care, as populations become more aware of possible treatments, and as equity principles reinforce the growth of demand. One aspect of the globalisation we have frequently recalled as shaping the worlds of particular concern to AKU is that it spreads both the demand for modern health care and a moral sense that it must be extended to all who need it. The danger that impossible burdens may be imposed on limited resources, even in the richest countries like the United States, is now vividly before the architects of health policy, and fearful talk of the necessity of rationing arises. "Solutions" to this situation are now a modern and very difficult Grail Search, which is complicated by growing awareness that the state of a population's health depends on more than the health care it has available. While we

cannot foresee what solutions may be found, we can be confident that the pressures driving the search will not diminish in the next decades, as populations rise, their education and awareness increases, and fatalistic acceptance wanes.

1.4 Whether driven by the search for more effective and affordable responses to rising demand or by the sheer fruitfulness of scientific and technical research, the practice of health care has been changing rapidly and may be expected to keep a fast pace of change in the next decades. The Economist recently [“Peering into 2010 : a Survey of the Future of Medicine”, supplement, pp.18, March 19, 1994] and somewhat breathlessly declared :

*“Biotechnology, faster and smarter computers, telecommunications and robotics are coming together to transform health care. New products are rolling out of laboratories at breathtaking speed ...*

*“There will be drugs for hitherto untreatable diseases. There will be easy-to-use medical tests that predict a person’s prospective state of health throughout his lifetime so steps can be taken to prevent diseases. There will be surgical robots operating with a precision that puts their human counterparts to shame. Doctors, nurses, hospitals and manufacturers will all be linked through a network of computers, telephones, optical fibres and satellite link-ups that a patient can plug into. The entire health-care business will be automated and closely monitored for cost and efficiency.*

*“The new generation of medical products will [make] it easier to measure health outcomes. Surgery will be less intrusive, less painful and safer ... Patients will recover more quickly and need less hospital care. As for drugs, biotechnology will re-engineer them from mere palliatives into full-scale cures that tackle not just the ills of rich countries but those of poorer countries too.”*

One need not be swept away by this enthusiastic set of prophecies in a respected journal to take it as fair indication that great and rapid changes are in prospect that will affect AKU’s mission in the health sciences. AKU is committed to a field that is challenging in almost any part it may choose to take for its special efforts.

1.5 In keeping with our general conception of the mission of AKU, its Faculty of Health Sciences should in the long run :

- provide exemplary education to health professionals, offering exemplary programmes of health care as well;
- contribute to the advancement of knowledge and policy through research and scholarship in its field.

The translation of these general propositions into specifics will involve many steps in AKU’s future, only some of which this Commission can foresee and propose. We assume that the Medical College and the School of Nursing will remain institutions of modest size, and hence that their distinctive contributions must come through the quality and the critical relevance of what they do. The competing tendencies and ambitions we have described in Section VI above impinge particularly strongly on the Medical College. It has no difficulty attracting far more highly qualified applicants for its classes than it can accept; it sets a valuable example in honest selection of the 1 in 35 or 40 applicants it can admit, and it offers those admitted a quality of education which is exemplary for Pakistan. It can already properly claim influence on standards of medical education in the country. But much about the content and outcomes of the education AKUMC offers remains unsettled. What AKUMC medical education may contribute toward solution of the problem of balance between training of specialists and general practitioners of medicine remains unclear. A large fraction of the graduates now undertake specialty training, either abroad or at AKUMC itself, and there is concern that those training abroad may not return. AKUMC may indeed be threatened like other Third World institutions of superior quality (e.g., the Indian Institutes of Technology) with supplying more graduates to the brain drain than to national competencies. But we should remember that migration of talent is not simply a loss; for AKU as an international university we should expect some of its graduates to follow international careers, making their contributions in scattered places; and for some of its specially talented graduates migration may be necessary to fulfilment of their potential. As the Commission’s work was drawing to a close we have had enthusiastic reports

from the September 1994 meeting in Washington, D.C. of graduates from the Faculty now in North America. The meeting both confirmed the capacity of AKU graduates to meet high standards where they are residents in major medical centres, and the interest many have in opportunities to use their training and talents in Pakistan.

The Medical Centre Committee was concerned with these matters and called for an “Educational Realignment” because “well trained, committed generalist physicians are badly needed to take leadership in dealing with [Pakistan’s typical] health problems”. The Faculty in its May 23, 1993 Commentary on the MCC Report argued that no such “realignment” was necessary, that the curriculum as it stood only needed to evolve rather than be realigned. But it did concede that more efforts were needed to develop community linkages and off-campus clinical sites for more immediate engagement with primary health care and community health needs. We take it that this exchange of views between the MCC Report and the Faculty Commentary may be typical of those that will go on more or less constantly over the next years, as AKU assesses what it is achieving and where it is heading. We understand that the Strategic Planning Committee of the Board has been established as a standing venue for surveillance and debate on these matters. **The contribution that this Commission may hope to make must be of a different sort, in one respect in defining long-term objectives that may guide year-to-year developments, and in another, viewing the health sciences in the full range of AKU’s future activities.**

**1.6** Just as we see AKU as a whole fated to straddle objectives that are not always easily compatible, we believe that this must be true in its engagements with health and health care. The Faculty of Health Sciences declares commitments to education, service, and research. It cannot now turn away from any of these and it will not be able to do so in the future, however difficult it may be to sustain and balance all three. MCC, facing very difficult financial questions, considered for a time an option that would drop undergraduate medical education. It may be possible to envisage a future AKU in which its contributions might be greater by taking such a step. But we do not believe that it is a realistic option. **We also stress that**

**AKU must seek to become an institution doing world-class medical research, and this in more than token amounts. But this does not mean that its medical component can become primarily a research institute or a graduate research centre like the Rockefeller University. Quite aside from the financial and other resource difficulties in doing so, there are other constraints which mean that AKU’s Faculty of Health Sciences is not free to focus solely on the advancement of knowledge.**

**1.7** Being enveloped in a community and an Aga Khan Development Network that is heavily concerned with health care, the University must be engaged with the cares and concerns of that community and the populations AKHS serves. It must, in short,

- offer education that provides opportunities and has relevance to the Ismaili and wider communities;

- provide services and leadership in the kinds of health problems that engage AKHS.

If these arguments are sound, **the Faculty of Health Sciences will be providing undergraduate education for doctors and nurses in 2020 or 2025, and thereafter.** The challenge will be to do so with distinction and this means doing more than providing a few hundred competent graduates each year; **the Faculty must be a model in addressing the health problems of the coming decades and in training outstanding professionals to address them.** The formula for contriving such a model institution for the developing world is not at hand. It must be a formula that responds to the extremely complex problems arising from the multiple determinants of health, the swelling demands for health care and the rapid changes in medical science and practice. The Medical College already has some years of experience in wrestling with the competing claims of primary health care, community medicine, and state-of-the-art curative medicine. It has not and, most probably, will not make a decisive choice in favour of one or the other. Surrounded by poor multitudes, it cannot ignore what Halfdan Mahler at the first Convocation in 1989 called “the holy book of health in this, and the next century”, viz., the Alma Ata testament on primary health care. At the same time it cannot abandon the capabilities that the hospital, now being lifted toward tertiary care

---

capacities as it follows MCC recommendations, and the competencies of its medical staff give it. Likewise, the pursuit of community health raises an awareness that has been strongly expressed in this Commission, viz., that there is more to the improvement of health than health care, a great range of social and economic factors needing attention too. If AKU cannot and will not make a radical choice among these competing claims it must, in honesty, do more than make respectful gestures toward all of them. It must face the awkward challenge of finding maxima or saddle-points for a function of three different variables.

The dilemmas of maintaining a selective institution that can attract superior talent while motivating this talent to concerns with the care of the remote and impoverished cannot be resolved with first degree education alone. [A point made in the Faculty Commentary in criticising MCC for focusing too much attention on the realignment of undergraduate education to this end; but MCC did recommend establishing postgraduate training programmes that are relevant to different kinds of practice in Pakistan and other developing countries.] Basic professional training must occur in a research atmosphere and be combined with wide views of the determinants of health, health policy, and systems of health care. Attaining these wider views must come through research, pilot and policy studies and programmes of graduate training.

### 1.8 *Research in the Faculty of Health Sciences*

We have depicted the health field as one that will stand in the forefront of public policy in coming decades and that will be subject to rapid scientific and technological advances. In such a field, AKU's Faculty of Health Sciences would be doomed to mediocrity if it did not keep abreast of the advances in knowledge and move nimbly to utilise emerging capacities in health care. **It is not merely a requisite of international prestige that AKU have strong research programmes; they are indispensable to its quality as a creative institution dealing with the problems of the developing and Muslim worlds.**

In discussing the state of higher education and research in the Muslim world, we have pointed out the extreme weakness of Muslim countries in scientific research. Like the Harvard

Committee before us, we believe that one of the very best opportunities for AKU to stand out in distinction lies in the development of a strong research programme. The possibility of doing so in the physical and biological sciences seem clearly to lie most prominently in the medical sciences and related fields. Recalling our earlier discussion of the indispensability of strength in the sciences for a distinguished university in the modern world, we would like to project a future for AKU that embraces first-class work across all the broad spectrum of the sciences. We think that in the next twenty or thirty years, ambitions must be more focused, and that AKU's start in the Health Sciences clearly indicates where the focus must be. The poor record of universities in the developing countries in the production of research indicates that this ambition will not be easy to fulfil. But we have been persuaded, not least by the confidence of the chief academic officer and his staff, that **it is a feasible ambition to bring AKU to international distinction in research in the biomedical and related fields in the next decades.**

It has been generally agreed in the Commission and among those who have brought us testimony that research at AKUMC has not yet been vigorously developed. Mr. Kassim-Lakha, President of the University Centre, had a general record of research projects, with sample papers, prepared for us. This record shows bright spots and a broad array of efforts undertaken with limited facilities, space, and financial resources. But it generally confirms the Commission's impression that the challenges of getting a hospital and instructional programmes into operation have, understandably, taken the greater part of the energies of the Faculty and administration of the University in its first years. There has been widespread recognition within the Faculty that research needed to be strengthened. We received testimony of this sort from the new Dean and chief academic officer, and from many others in our meetings with faculty and staff in Karachi. We have recently been pleased to read a draft interim report of the Faculty's Research Committee for Strategic Planning and another paper on an Infectious Diseases Research Programme, both drafted by the recently appointed head of Community Health Sciences, Dr. Joseph McCormick. The former presents an ambitious set of recommendations : that all departments develop plans toward having 20-25%

of faculty time devoted to research; that 20,000 square feet of research space be created over the next 5-10 years; that a post-graduate programme be given an early start; and that an endowed fund for research be established that would eventually provide \$ 1 million per year. The second paper develops the possibilities of an infectious disease programme, stressing locational advantages of AKU in dealing with many of these diseases, the cost effectiveness and the efficacy that AKU could attain. This programme would extend over the range of AKUMC's professional competencies from clinical medicine to molecular biology and basic science.

The Commission has, from its first meetings, been disposed to recommend increased emphasis on research in the Faculty of Health Sciences. It now appears that we may be pushing an open door. Actions are already occurring, as in the recent approval of a Master's Degree Programme in Epidemiology, which move in this direction. We have said that we do not think that AKUMC will or should evolve into a pure research centre, and we must be concerned that the costliness of the expansion sketched out in the Strategic Planning paper might make such demands on limited resources that the broadening of AKU into more than a limited university serving a few professional specialities would be thwarted for a long time. We are, however, not intimidated by the demands of making AKU a serious research university. We are indeed, recommending several new components which will have research as an essential part of the programmes. Some like the Institute of Human Development are very closely related to the work of the Faculty of Health Sciences; and indeed, others have natural links to the subjects of Community Health and Health Policy and Management to which we now turn.

### 1.9 *Health Policy and Management*

"Health systems" was one of the subjects proposed some years ago as a research theme for AKU. The Harvard Report recommended that "Health Policy and Management" be one of the subjects that should be developed promptly as the University extended its work. It conceived this subject as part of a broader Centre of Development Policy and Management, to be located not in Pakistan, but preferably in East Africa. A feasibility study for this centre in East Africa was

undertaken but later abandoned.<sup>13</sup> The idea of a programme in Health Policy and Management, linked to the Faculty of Health Sciences in Karachi was revived in 1989. In his address at the Convocation on March 20 that year, the Chancellor mentioned several programmes in which the University believed it had "a unique capacity to be of service". Among them :

*"... and of very great importance, the University is being drawn toward the field of research in health policy and management : the study of health economics, epidemiology, and the management sciences that will be of value to the policy maker as well as to the future manager of health programmes and institutions. This University must aim to produce the leaders in health policy as well as in medicine."*

The Board of Trustees directed at that time that a feasibility study be undertaken, but it was aborted by events in Pakistan and the Gulf.<sup>14</sup> The idea of an AKU initiative in this field then lay fallow until it was again recommended by the MCC Committee in its report in 1993.

The Commission has been impressed that AKU must move into the subject of Health Policy and Management if, as the Chancellor said, it is to "produce leaders in health policy as well as in medicine". We have recognised that important elements of work toward this objective have already been present in Community Health Sciences. Movement toward a full-fledged programme in Health Policy and Management obviously can start from these beginnings and has recently occurred in the Trustees' authorisation of a Master's degree in the field under the Department of Community Health Sciences. Detailed planning of a sort this Commission cannot undertake will now go forward, and the future organisation of work in the field will be influenced by this start. The Commission does, however, wish to affirm its views that :

**- a programme in Health Policy and Management should be a part of the future University's commitment to the health field; and that this programme must involve graduate study, research, field studies and experimentation in both Pakistan and other countries, keeping "generic" and not purely local concerns.**

<sup>13</sup> An account of this history was included in the Agenda Paper for the Commission's second meeting in Karachi in February 1993, item 6; history of the subsequent initiatives linked to AKUMC in Pakistan is also given there.

<sup>14</sup> Martin Klein and Gary Filerman, President of the Association of University Programs in Health Administration, were engaged as consultants; terms of reference were drawn up which particularly emphasised the needs of Pakistan and how AKU might complement existing resources there. A consulting team of five members was to visit Pakistan in fall, 1990 but it was delayed by a change of government in Pakistan and when re-scheduled was disrupted by the outbreak of the Gulf War.

- the programme must recognise that health policy involves more than health care, and concern itself with a wide range of social and economic questions.

We may need to remind our readers what the subject of health policy and management embraces. It is, as one of our members has said, a "fearsomely broad and complex" subject involving such questions as the public/private mix in designing and providing services, the allocation of health care resources between primary, secondary, and tertiary levels, and between curative and preventive activities. It must be concerned with the mobilisation of financial resources and the personnel required; it must deal with management problems at several levels from individual institutions to communities and entire nations. It must also assess factors that are not part of the health care system as such but clearly are important for the health of nations.<sup>15</sup> We expect that the programmes we are recommending in human development and economic growth will heighten appreciation of the importance of these factors.

The broad specifications we propose for this subject show that **dealing with it properly will require competencies the University does not now have** - in management and policy studies, economics and other social sciences. The Commission has had to ask if these competencies should be built up within a Health Policy and Management unit at AKUMC in Karachi, or can be drawn from other parts of the University, such as the Institute of Economic Growth and Society we are proposing. We think it necessary that the University a quarter century hence will have competencies in economic and social development, in the planning of urban and rural areas and on the environment, built and natural, that it does not now have. The broad subject of national health policy that we see looming ahead, formidable in importance and difficulty, cannot be analysed without such competencies. We do not think we can rigidly specify how, where, and when these competencies may be built up. But we must relate the future of Health Policy and Management in AKU to other components we are proposing for AKU's future. We cannot properly complete discussion of this subject until we have described other components. But it is clear that :

- where the additional competencies AKU will need are located will be a critical determinant of its international spread. There are evident advantages in locating the Health Policy and Management component of AKU in Pakistan, alongside or as a part of the Faculty of Health Sciences, and not as the Harvard Report recommended, in another country and another organisational context. The current planning for this subject within the Community Health Sciences Department reminds us that its future will be affected by the evolution of that large department, which is not easy for us to foresee. We assume that the University will continue to favour the Pakistan location. But recalling the principle we expressed earlier (Section VI), viz., that "An AKU that has all its principal components in Pakistan will not be a sufficiently international university", we think Health Policy and Management should develop with strong relationships to components of the University located elsewhere (notably the Institutes described in C.5 and C.6) below, and to networks that stretch far beyond Pakistan.

#### **1.10 *A Broadened Education for Professionals in the Health Sciences***

Two priorities in the future growth of AKU in the health sciences are proposed in the foregoing discussion. Developing strengths in health policy and management and in medical research are both ambitious and demanding undertakings. But a **third priority must be added. If the graduates of AKU are to have the qualities that will make them leaders across the range of health needs of the developing and Muslim worlds they must be more than competent specialists; they must have the reach of mind, flexibility and strength of character that rest on a broader education.** The first two of our priorities point toward strengthening AKU's Faculty of Health Sciences in research and graduate study; the latter points more toward the basic education of all its students.

Pursuing the aim of deepening and enriching the education of AKU's students follows from the mission that His Highness declared in the Charter Acceptance Speech must "remain constant : the mission of preparing graduates, men and women, to play constructive, worthwhile and responsible roles in society". Being a small

<sup>15</sup> Further discussion of this subject and what its proper development will require is contained in a memorandum of David Bell to Francis Sutton, dated July 5, 1994.

---

university, AKU must even try to prepare its graduates so that they may make contributions in their careers that will be disproportionately greater than their numbers. To do so, AKU graduates must be prepared to cope with the modern world's exciting opportunities, its confusing enticements, its mounting complexities and its erosions of tradition. We have argued earlier that AKU has both a special opportunity and a compelling need to face this educational problem for the Muslim world. It is a challenge that transcends the Faculty of Health Sciences but in which this Faculty may be the necessary locus of early responses. In the discussions the Commission has had with the faculty and staff in Karachi, we have heard proposals that broader, more humanistic education drawing on Islamic cultural traditions be given to the AKU students. We have also been informed of proposals for extending the regular programme for medical students by a year or so, either through a preparatory year or by adding courses that would give them a broader and enhanced base for their professional education and their later careers.

**The Commission applauds these initiatives** which conform to some of its principal recommendations for AKU's long-term growth and mission. We do not comment further here on these subjects but will do so later, particularly in part C.7 below, on Arts and Science Education in AKU.

**1.11** The future that the Commission envisages for the health sciences in AKU in the next quarter-century is thus one of strong development. **We do not think the Faculty of Health Sciences can afford to stand still while other parts of the University are launched and catch up. We make these sanguine projections in full awareness of financial problems that the Faculty has experienced and that were addressed by the Medical Centre Committee. We shall turn later in Section VIII to our perception of future financial requirements and sources. We conclude this part of our discussion with some observations on keeping proportions within the University.**

**1.12** It is notorious that medicine and health are greedy parts of academia. In a recent symposium on the American research universities, the president of Johns Hopkins University,

William C. Richardson, presented an essay entitled "The Appropriate Scale of the Health Sciences Enterprise" [*Daedalus*, fall 1993, pp.179-195] which addressed familiar disquiets in American academia over the burgeoning scale of these health enterprises. Richardson noted that between 1960 and 1990 total U.S. medical school revenues grew at a rate that was approximately twice that of total revenues of all U.S. institutions of higher learning. The fact of the matter, he said, is that the scale of the health enterprise in the American research university has been "substantially defined by the marketplace; it is opportunity driven" and yet it should not be "so large as to deform the overall mission and character of the academic institution with which the health sciences centre forms one piece of the whole". Johns Hopkins and AKU are far apart in scale and geography but they share to a remarkable degree the same set of problems. The President of Johns Hopkins looks to his and other health centres to "do the right thing" by achieving: "(1) a more appropriate balance between primary care and specialisation; (2) greater responsiveness to the needs of the community, including preventive care as applied to populations rather than individuals, and health-care delivery based in various home and community settings rather than in the hospital; and (3) a conscientious outreach to and integration with other academic departments and divisions within the home university". [ibid, p.189]

Like Johns Hopkins, in trying to do all these "right things", AKU will continue to have a serious problem of the appropriate balance and scale of its health enterprise within the University. One has only to consult the list of new undertakings the Chancellor gave in his 1989 Convocation Speech, or read the array of capital improvements and new developments in the hospital and clinical services that MCC found urgent, or listen to the faculty and staff in Karachi in the meetings we have held with them, to perceive that this health enterprise has worthy uses for far more resources than it presently has. It could indeed absorb most of the resources that could be used to make AKU into the diversified and international university it has aimed to be. Restraints will evidently be needed if the first-born is not to deny life to its later siblings.

## C.2 *The Future of IED and Education in AKU*

2.1 AKU is a member of a large array of Aga Khan institutions concerned with education from the pre-school through primary and secondary levels to the University. And as a University dedicated to addressing the "generic problems" of developing countries, AKU has been drawn to a concern with the quality and availability of education. The result has been the early establishment of the Institute for Educational Development as the first component of AKU outside the health sciences. The Commission has sought to determine if and how AKU should sustain this commitment to education in its future development.

## 2.2 *The State and Prospects of Education in the Third World*

Our review in Section III of this Report of changes in education in the developing and Muslim worlds since the Harvard Report has focused on higher education, where we found irresistible demand producing great expansion and poor quality. Something similar could have been said about education at all levels. There has not only been enormous private demand for education but a driving sense that education is a basic human right that should be available to all. Ambitions to eradicate illiteracy and make education universal have produced great efforts in the decades since World War II. In the 1990s, the U.N.'s Jomtien slogan "Education for All" is the rallying cry for continuing these efforts, which are still far from reaching their declared goals. The UNESCO 1993 *World Education Report* questions the alleged widening of the "knowledge gap" between developed and developing countries, but concedes that the "literacy gap" and the "schooling gap" are only narrowing, not disappearing. It cautiously recognises quality problems under the gross statistics, with the poorer countries marked by short "school life expectancy", short school years, lack of textbooks and other teaching materials. In other sources, less constrained by official responsibilities, the prevalence of poor quality is more forthrightly asserted and deplored. There are, of course, marked differences between the countries that have been growing economically and those that are stagnant or declining, with the African countries showing deterioration throughout their whole educational systems like that we noted earlier in higher education.

Education has always been regarded as a major requisite of development. After some initial hesitations, it was given a solid status in economic development theory in the human capital doctrines. But in recent decades, the examples of Japan, China, and the "East Asian tigers", as countries with limited natural wealth but impressive human resources, have brought a heightened sense of the critical importance of human qualities in economic progress. Since better education is the most evident way to raise the competencies of national populations, official policies now put new emphasis on educational reform and are encouraged to do so by the World Bank and other powers in the international sphere.<sup>16</sup>

Parts of the world that are of particular interest to AKU are among those where the present state of education gives particular concern. Pakistan has regularly made a very poor showing on the UNDP's Human Development Index, which combines GNP per capita, expectation of life at birth, and level of literacy. The country is presently under a barrage of international criticism for its low expenditures on education and health and its high expenditures on defence. Whatever the justification for these allocations, the 1993 *World Education Report* shows that only 5.0% of Pakistan's total governmental expenditure (in 1980, no figure given for 1990) went for education, a strikingly low figure in comparison with Kenya's 16.7% and Uganda's 22.5% (1990 figures). The stagnation or economic deterioration in East Africa has produced declines in Kenyan and Tanzanian allocations for education in the face of the sharply rising numbers of children the educational systems must serve. In Kenya increasing fee burdens have been imposed on parents with the result that many children are denied schooling by their family's poverty (or in some cases, by their sheer lack of family). The effects of these straitened economic conditions on the quality of education are less conspicuous but hardly less serious.

A concern that the Muslim world may still be resistant to schools and formal education has appeared in the discussions of the Commission. And the suggestion has been made that East Asian countries were progressing faster than Muslim countries because of their enthusiastic receptivity to imported forms of education. Statistical comparisons across different countries do not show clear differentials between Muslim and non-

<sup>16</sup> The West Indies, which our Secretary visited for a meeting of the Comparative and International Education Society during the time of the Commission's work, is a pertinent example. These islands are mostly poor in natural resources and the prospects for economic growth in traditional industries are poor. There is consequently the conviction that new industries must be developed, which will depend on the quality of the labour force. There is a widespread conviction, noted in a 1993 World Bank survey of education in the region, that though the quantitative gains in education have been good, quality has been declining; hence a call for educational reform to make better human resources and a better future for the West Indies.

Muslim developing countries, except in gender, where Muslim countries show characteristically higher female illiteracy rates, and lower levels of attained education for girls and women. Present understanding of the multiple gains in performance and initiative from the education of girls suggests that the Muslim world may have been disadvantaged in ways not immediately obvious by a slow development of education for girls. There may also be other cultural influences of Islam that affect the receptivity of Muslims to forms of modern education that are important to economic and social progress. Better understanding of such influences is certainly desirable and could be a significant mission for AKU. This is a field in which AKU can build on the AKES's experience in such ventures as the pre-school programme in India and the *Madrasah* project in East Africa.

We expect a basic continuity in the problems of education in the developing world in the next quarter-century. In successful and unsuccessful countries alike, we anticipate continued faith in education as a basis of national programmes and searches for ways to make it more effective. In the less fortunate countries the pressures of rising populations and the competition for limited employment opportunities in slowly growing economies will bring heavy demands for education that will be hard to meet with satisfactory quality. Serious threats to the social return from educational investment will come from poor quality, and one of the most important challenges will be to achieve better average quality in large and sluggishly responsive publicly-supported school systems. The growth of private schooling that has been a feature of recent decades is likely to continue, with increasing differentiation in the quality - and hence the prestige and value - of education within a country. Another challenge, particularly attractive for a private university like AKU, will be to find ways whereby high quality private education may have radiating effects beyond a few privileged schools. Even the more successful among the developing countries will face a similar array of problems and needs.

### 2.3 *AKU's Continuing Mission in Education for the Developing and Muslim Worlds*

Our brief sketch of the state and prospects of education in the developing and Muslim worlds strongly suggests continuing opportunities for AKU to make contributions of

many sorts to educational advance over the coming decades. Because of its concern with some poor and remote populations the Aga Khan Education Services have joined in efforts of our time to extend education toward universality. These AKES efforts have opened opportunities for AKU to advance understanding of the problems of expanding educational coverage. Nevertheless, the potential of AKES and AKU in bringing quantitative expansion of education is clearly limited; they will remain small amid the vastness of national educational systems; their prospects of important contributions by showing ways to bring about qualitative improvement in education look much greater.

The problems of achieving better quality in education are complex and subtle. They pose both intellectual and pedagogical challenges worthy of a university's competencies. Some of them are cultural and diffuse in character. We have noted, for example, how recent gains in understanding the consequences of women's education, may have broad implications for Muslim countries. Some are closely related to actual conditions and practice in the schools, such as IED is currently addressing. The possible forms of an AKU contribution to education in the developing and Muslim worlds can thus be very diverse. Since IED is presently funded only for a six and a quarter year period, the prospect that education might not be a permanent subject for AKU has been a logical possibility. But we find the foregoing arguments compelling for the conclusion that **AKU should have a continuing mission in the educational needs and problems of the developing and Muslim worlds.** We have sought to envisage in what form this mission might best be pursued a quarter century from now.

Three possible futures in education have been discussed by the Commission :

- a continued development and expansion of IED;
- the establishment of a School or Faculty of Education, offering various degrees;
- an institute with a primary focus on research, linked or perhaps at some point merged with the Institute of Human Development proposed in Section VII C.4 below.

---

**2.4 The Institute for Educational Development** is making a strong start in response to deeply felt needs in Pakistan. Its performance will inevitably exercise a strong influence on AKU's future in education. IED's initial strategy of educational improvement through raising teachers' status and competence is already being expanded to embrace other elements of AKF's School Improvement Programmes. Pressures for further expansion of IED's agenda rose immediately with the appointment of the first director, and before its first classes began; curricular revisions and enrichment, examination practices, etc., have been proposed as further undertakings for it. In addition to what IED undertakes itself, there are indications that its director and staff will be increasingly called upon for consultation on educational practices and policy.

Whatever extension of its functions IED undertakes, its initial strategy involves the building of Professional Development Centres. If this strategy is to lead to widespread effects, these centres must multiply, inside Pakistan and in other developing countries, either through AKU's own efforts or those of others whom it may inspire to action. IED must, of course, be an exemplary project to achieve these widening consequences. But we hope and expect it will be so.

**2.5** We thus conceive that IED may grow vigorously over the coming decades in the basic pattern in which it has started whether or not it adds curricular and examinations functions to the teacher training functions that have been its initial core. A large and promising future of this sort can be envisaged, given the abundance of educational problems and the paucity of appealing models and professional resources in the Muslim and other developing countries. We do not think IED could successfully grow in this way without strong research programmes to guide it; the pursuit of such research would assure that in education, as in its other fields of activity, AKU does not neglect research.

**2.6** A growth of IED to a scale where it could be an important influence on educational policy and practice not only in Pakistan but more widely in Asia and Africa implies needs for substantial resources. Adding to the numbers of Professional Development Centres will bring one set of needs, and new functions will require further resources. Some of these may come from interested aid

agencies as they have for IED's initial funding. Some may come from contract or consulting income. Taking on responsibilities for curriculum development or examination building (and for the headaches inevitably associated therewith!) would only be sensible if AKU were directly and adequately rewarded for doing so. The successes of organisations like the Academy for Educational Development and the Educational Testing Service in the United States show that in rich countries there is an effective demand for services such as a future IED might supply to Pakistan and other developing countries. It remains to be tested whether or not IED could flourish in this pattern, but we believe it is possible. In any such development, some claims - perhaps quite large ones - would be made on general AKU resources that might be used for other purposes. Hence a vigorous development of IED would compete with the growth of other components in the future AKU. Its justification for competing would be strengthened by what it does in instruction and research.

IED was established under educational doctrines that opposed the establishment of a School or Faculty of Education in AKU. The 1991 proposal to the BOT said :

*"There are particular and notorious difficulties in associating the tasks of teacher preparation and educational development with a research university. The School or Department so created is divided in its sympathy and policies. ... Schools of Education tend to be large, and even imperialist, growing rapidly and uncomfortably in a University which (almost by definition) prefers quality to quantity. These considerations have particular force when the University in view [like AKU] is relatively young and properly jealous of its growing reputation."*

Hence the placing of teacher training in Professional Development Centres away from the University proper in "real" schools. These educational doctrines have been based on experience that has been learnedly surveyed by Harry Judge, one of the architects of IED. ["Schools of Education and Teacher Education", pp.37-55, in *Oxford Studies in Comparative Education*, v.1. (1991).] He showed an evolution in Britain, France and the U.S. toward more university education for prospective teachers but

---

with continued separation of professional training from the universities in Britain and France, while in the United States, where Schools of Education have persisted in the universities they have been much criticised and ill-regarded.

Should the doctrine against a School or Faculty of Education in AKU be taken as a short-run or permanent injunction? Should we envisage IED growing into a School of Education or perhaps being incorporated into one at some time? The issue, as the Commission has seen it, turns on the roles of degree programmes and research in AKU's future work in this field. The architects of IED did want it linked to the University, which would offer Master's degrees to some trainees, and certificates to others. Proposals are already appearing for new degree programmes at both Bachelor's and Master's levels. It is conceivable that IED might by steady accretion grow to be more like a campus-based School of Education rather than the scattered, school-based set of training and improvement activities it set out to be. Should this sort of evolution be resisted? We find it difficult to take a categorical position. The in-service education for basically qualified professionals that IED is now offering fits a pattern which we can foresee AKU following to advantage in several fields. We should think it ought to be maintained, but it is not clear that this work need be significantly affected if IED evolved into a school or faculty. We can readily conceive that there will be selected degree programmes that AKU could execute well and that would be a good use of its distinctive assets. **But we find serious reasons to resist either inadvertent or deliberate growth of AKU into a large-scale educator of teachers.** The status of teachers in developing countries will unfortunately not be easy to raise significantly in the foreseeable future. Remuneration will remain unattractive with the adverse effects on the quality of aspirants for the teaching profession that have been lamentably familiar in recent decades. **If there is to be a School of Education in AKU it should not have a large student body, and should probably avoid first degrees.**

**2.7** A certain immiscibility of teacher training and a university's commitment to research was one of the assumptions on which IED doctrine was based. Harry Judge in his survey observed that "the imperatives of research are not those of teaching or teacher preparation" and this was an important reason he found the relationship

between schools of education and universities an uncomfortable one. [op.cit. p.51] The proposal for IED in fact dwelt at some length on the research that should accompany its work but there was no initial funding to support it. The Commission in its first consideration of IED noted this gap with concern. Some attention to research is now assured under (Canadian) IDRC funding, but the demands of expanding operations will make it difficult to keep a strong place for research and intellectual objectives in the work of IED. We do appreciate that there is force in the view that devotion to teacher training and to research are not easily mixed. IED was established not simply to understand how young people were developing and what was happening in the schools of Pakistan; it was intended to improve these schools and the teaching within them. It is quite properly devoting itself to these meliorative objectives. In the possible future of an expanded IED which we sketched out above, it would remain focused on improving the quality of education in various ways. Research to assess the sources of successes and failures, and to point the way toward new experiments is a natural and necessary accompaniment of such programmes. Indeed, we have said above that research of this sort will be imperative, both to sound development of IED and to the wider influence it may have on educational practice and policy. **But we are reluctant to accept that AKU's role in study and research on education should be confined to these applied forms; we would like to see it contribute to a deeper understanding of the meanings and importance of education and human development in the areas of the world which are its special concern.**

**2.8** In its consideration of missions for AKU in this area the Commission has given particular attention to the broad subject of **human development**. As we shall explain at some length in Section VII C.4 below, this is a subject broader than formal education, embracing biological maturation, physical, environmental and cultural influences, including of course those of formal education. The growing perception that the development and prosperity of societies depends on their human resources makes all countries anxious to promote the quality of their own people. Education is an important source of human development but only one source, and we anticipate that there will be growing perception of the need to understand in broader ways how

---

capable human beings are fostered. In the developing world, the incidence of adverse conditions is particularly likely, and in this field as in others, there is a great disparity between the research devoted to the rich and to the poor countries. The engagement of AKU in both education and the health sciences gives it resources to approach this subject in the comprehensive way that is needed, in settings where research has been too scattered, or quite lacking.

**2.9 The Commission is proposing (in Section VII C.4 below) the establishment of an AKU Institute of Human Development which would engage in research and graduate study in this field and it has envisaged the possibility that IED might evolve into such an Institute.** We have, however, come to the views expressed in the paragraphs above, viz., that AKU should continue activities in the field of education that are not primarily in research. We are persuaded that the strong international support IED has attracted would not have been available for a start as a research institute and we think AKU will continue to find stronger support for an educational programme that has diverse functions. AKU will not be as significant in showing the way to better education for the developing and Muslim worlds if it does not combine its innovations and demonstrations with research of high quality. Some of this research effort should be an integral part of IED (or whatever it may grow into) but we anticipate that much can be supplied through the Institute of Human Development we are proposing. We conceive that that Institute will be separate from IED, and perhaps closer to the Faculty of Health Sciences; but clearly it must have close relations to IED and for some purposes serve as its research arm. It is conceivable, for example, that as IED spreads into several locations as suggested above, one or more of its branches might be accompanied by branches of the Institute of Human Development.

**2.10** A particular hope and concern of the Commission deserves special mention. It is that AKU will provide illumination and example toward the strengthening of education in Muslim countries. We urge that this concern be high on the agenda of the future IED. But what IED does must be supported by other parts of the university, and notably by those devoted to Islamic culture and civilisations, and to human development.

**2.11 The location of AKU's future activities in education and human development must take into account the need for international dispersion to achieve broad relevance.** It must also be influenced by the distribution of Aga Khan schools and educational facilities. The large concentration of these latter in Pakistan has been sufficient cause and stimulus for the starting of IED in Pakistan. The case for continuing to centre AKU's educational component, whether a Faculty or an expanded IED, in Pakistan is clearly very strong, perhaps even compelling. But the present concentration of all AKU's activities in Pakistan and the Commission's view that expansions in the health sciences and biomedical research should probably occur in proximity to AKUMC lead us to ask how education and human development might be located elsewhere. The spread of AKES schools in East Africa and India directs attention to these places. The needs of Tajikistan also beckon. The expectation that IED may successfully multiply its Professional Development Centres means that it may have one or more of them in East Africa before very long. India appears less likely for political reasons and there are several reasons, linguistic and otherwise, why a PDC in Tajikistan is unlikely soon. The difficulty and interest of educational problems in East Africa need little elaboration. They strengthen the case for a shift in the balance of AKU's educational interest toward East Africa. We feel strongly that AKU should, in education as in other fields, keep its sights on generic problems that are shared by many nations. It should be at least as international in its educational work as the network of Aga Khan schools is. Granting that the case for maintaining the centre of gravity of AKU's educational programmes in Pakistan may be compelling, we urge that a secondary locus be developed in East Africa; it will be surrounded by a rich array of needs and problems and may assure better linkages to India, and perhaps other places, than will be possible from Pakistan.

---

### **C.3 *An AKU Institute Devoted to Study of Islamic Civilisations***

**3.1** In earlier sections of this report we have presented arguments and evidence that changes in the world have made the mission of the Aga Khan University as a Muslim university more important than it was a decade ago. Agitated concerns over the proper role of Islam in the economies, the public life

and governance of Muslim countries, and tensions in the relations of Islam with the “West” are now at high levels; and they seem likely to remain so in the coming decades. The well-being and serenity of the Muslim Ummah in the 21st century will depend on many things, on economic growth, on improvements in education and health and other requisites of the good life to which AKU may contribute through its various faculties and programmes. But we have also proposed in Section V that AKU pursue its special mission as a Muslim institution by developing : (1) research and scholarship on Islamic civilisations and the contemporary Muslim world; (2) education for AKU students and materials for the education of others, Muslims and non-Muslims; (3) a participation with others, Muslim and non-Muslim, in coping with the problems of the modern world. **We regard these matters as of great urgency, and recommend that an Institute of Islamic Civilisations be given first priority as AKU broadens beyond its present fields of activity.**

**3.2** We believe that AKU is exceptionally well-placed to develop as a unique Muslim university in the 21st century. There is the comparative advantage that Professor Keenan stressed in 1983, viz., that unlike other Muslim universities it need not be hostage to a particular government or the conditions in a particular country, and can devote itself in exceptional freedom to the “Islamisation of modernity”. The name of the Aga Khan has also been associated with the highest levels of scholarship through such beneficences as the Aga Khan Professorships of Iranian and of Islamic Art and Architecture at Harvard, and the Aga Khan Professorship of Architecture and Design for Islamic Culture at MIT. Through these professorships and the Aga Khan Program for Islamic Architecture (AKPIA) at these institutions it may be fairly claimed that the name of the Aga Khan has been decisively associated with the building of the academic field of Islamic art and architecture - a field which hardly existed as a living academic community before these benefactions and programmes.<sup>17</sup> In the wider domains of practice, the Architectural Awards Programme has brought similar association of the Aga Khan’s name with concern for promoting the quality and cultural sensitivity of architecture in the Muslim world, an association now being extended through the Historic Cities Support

Programme. Indeed, over the field of its interests, the Aga Khan Trust for Culture stands nearly alone. In a less conspicuous way, the Institute of Ismaili Studies has engaged many of the world’s leading scholars of Islam, and is now launching a very promising new graduate programme in Islamic studies.

**3.3** AKU thus has freedom, resources and a prestigious tradition behind it that give the potential for very important, perhaps even unique, contributions as a Muslim university. But what does it mean to be a Muslim university and what, concretely, must AKU do to fulfil the missions we have sketched out for it ?

**3.4** We have described briefly in Section III.4 of this report the pattern of distinction between universities in the Muslim world based on Western models and universities that are devoted to Islamic learning. We have also described two efforts, in Jordan and Malaysia, to develop forms of higher education that seek to combine imported professional and scientific education with Islamic elements, aiming to produce graduates who are good Muslims, as well as competent citizens of their countries and the modern world. There have clearly been similar aspirations for AKU to be a Muslim university in more senses than that it seeks to serve the Muslim world and has most of its activities therein.

**3.5** Such aspirations appeared in responses to the Harvard Committee’s recommendations on AKU studies of Muslim culture and societies. A 1988 paper on the proposed Faculty of Islamic Humanities for AKU that grew out of the Harvard report spoke of avoiding “purely secularistic analytical positions”; and Mohammed Arkoun, one of the principal architects of the new programme at the Institute of Ismaili Studies, has resisted “purely ethnographic” views of cultures. [In *Ouverture sur l’Islam* Paris (Grancher) 1992, and certainly elsewhere in his abundant writings.] Aspirations of AKU to be an educational institution in more than technocratic respects inevitably press it to more than analytical concerns with Islam and Muslim societies. Our acceptance of missions for AKU in the education of both Muslims and non-Muslims in the modern world must imply the sympathetic agreement in the Commission with such a stance. AKU in a great part of its present and future work must have

<sup>17</sup> Cf. Oleg Grabar’s account of the growth of this field in *The Study of the Middle East* (1976) and subsequent writings.

the detached and critical stance of modern learning. But as a university representing and studying the Islamic tradition from which it springs it cannot rest in cool detachment. It must seek ways to **combine disciplined, objective inquiry with imaginative efforts to use its heritage to provide visions of the meaning of life in the modern world.**<sup>18</sup>

3.6 In pursuing these high objectives, the opposite pole to pure detachment of adopting an apologetic or defensive attitude - championing rather than understanding, insisting on dogma rather than elucidation - must be avoided. This is particularly important in view of the strident manifestation of such attitudes in some of the contemporary extremist Islamic movements.

3.7 What should then be the course between these poles for AKU? Intellectually and conceptually, the non-normative and constructive programme in graduate studies now being launched by the Institute of Ismaili Studies in collaboration with Cambridge University has appealed strongly to the Commission. The missions of IIS and AKU are different and we see good reasons to keep them distinct. But the approach to Islam as a civilisation in the historical and non-normative ways that appear in the programme with Cambridge has commended itself to us as appropriate for AKU. We therefore quote at some length, salient passages from the Institute's current philosophical statement :

*"The programme seeks to avoid a division of pertinent disciplines ... in the study of Muslim societies ... [aiming] to produce an integrated analysis ... conceived as broadly as possible ... The premise is that 'Islam' can more fruitfully be treated as a civilisation (our emphasis, here and subsequently) rather than a religion only ... This means ... that religious developments will be seen as part of the development of thought and culture in Muslim societies [and] those aspects of culture, like art, poetry, and architecture, which are not always treated at par with doctrine, law or religious practice, will be so regarded in this programme ... As culture cannot be studied in isolation from society ... [the] inter-relationship of ideas and meanings to social and political forces will be treated as one of the keys to integrated understanding of the subject."* (this last sentence slightly re-arranged).

*"... the diverse definitions and schools of thought which emerged in Islam must be understood historically ... A historical approach to Islam must be balanced by a due appreciation of the meaning religious ideas have for their followers ... The programme will give due attention, therefore, to the role of poetic and imaginative discourse in the shaping of spiritual life in Muslim cultures ... While the approach to Islam as a civilisation is intended to integrate as well as enlarge both the subject matter and the angles of study, this does not preclude an appreciation of the enormous diversity of Muslim societies ... The diversity of these expressions [of Islam] must be noted without normative judgements of their validity ... Similarly, the programme will examine the important 'classical' languages (Arabic, Persian) but also national, regional or local vernaculars ... Two other objectives of this non-normative approach [are] ... to re-examine the emphasis on 'learned' ... Islam to the relative neglect of 'popular' and oral traditions ... and to pay full attention to the practical manifestation of Islamic ideals in living societies.*

*"... [T]here is a surviving tendency in the field of Islamic studies for the studies of the past to proceed along separate lines from those of contemporary Muslim societies ... The intellectual framework of this programme is designed to bridge this gap ... The study of the vast changes introduced in [contemporary Muslim] societies in the modern period will pay attention to the meaning and images of the past, which are current in these societies ...*

*"The polarity of 'Islam' and the 'West', assumed in much of contemporary discourse about the subject, needs to be subjected to critical analysis ... The overlap of some of the more fundamental issues of society and culture today (across Western and non-Western lands, or across the developed and developing worlds) will be noted without the distortions inherent in too facile an opposition between the 'West' and 'non-West'."*

The projected course of graduate studies leading to a Master's Degree from Cambridge was described for the Commission by Dr. Aziz Esmail at our London meeting. It embraces a two year programme (three years in total time) with courses on the following subjects, plus several others : "The Quran : Meaning, History and Text"; "Authority, Power, and the Body-Politic: Historical and Anthropological Perspectives" ;

<sup>18</sup> The challenge facing modern education has been expressed by Aziz Esmail, Dean of the IIS, as follows: "Today's world demands a new understanding of old verities, an understanding that cannot simply be handed out, but must evolve out of a real engagement of the visions of the great world religions on the one hand, and the world of modern, science-based, industrialised culture on the other." [*The Canadian Ismaili*, July, 1990, p.31]

“Law, Ethics and Society”; “Reason and Imagination”; “Religious Beliefs, Ritual Expression and Social Change”; “Critical Approaches to Modernity : the Encounter of Cultures : Islam and the West”.

As we have said, the Commission has found this programme very helpfully suggestive for what might be developed in AKU. It has the breadth of mind and spirit, the firm commitment to objectivity and standards of modern scholarship, and the high quality leadership we want to see in AKU’s future. Its non-normative approach, elevated above sectarian dogma, commends itself particularly to the Commission. The agenda before AKU’s Institute will certainly differ considerably from IIS’s present agenda. The educational purposes we propose for the AKU Institute would aim not only at graduate study but at first-degree liberal education within and beyond AKU; the research topics it would pursue cannot now be foreseen in detail but they would undoubtedly embrace humanistic studies and studies of social problems that will differ from those to which IIS would (properly) give priority. Needless to say the new role we envisage for AKU in this field would in no way encroach upon the current responsibilities of IIS to the Ismaili Jamat, which would continue as before.

**3.8** We do not think it proper for this Commission to try to specify in detail what the AKU Institute we are proposing should do. We believe that this sort of planning ought to be left for the founding leadership of the Institute aided by a Task Force that would have appropriate engagement of the central administration, the Board and its relevant committees. But we should give some indications of the broad conception of the Institute that has led us to enthusiasm for it as an important component of the future AKU.

**3.9** We believe that AKU should study Islam within its framework as a set of civilisations, rather than primarily or solely as a religion; and see these civilisations in wider analytical and comparative perspectives. In particular the AKU Institute should address the meaning of modernity, contemporary problems of the Muslim world, and the encounters of Islam and the West. It will have a research agenda but should also, and perhaps more importantly, make synthetic efforts at grasping the character of Islamic civilisations as they have been, and the complex social, cultural

and historical processes they undergo in the modern world. This is an enterprise with basically educational and philosophical purposes, one that may help individuals and societies find meaning and purpose in the traditions and the worlds they inhabit. It is, of course, an intellectual enterprise of a high order, demanding first-class talents and erudition. We would assume that such efforts could only be successfully executed by original and creative scholars who would also engage in their own specialised research. But we would think the intellectual distinction of this AKU Institute should be found at least as much in its synoptic and educational works as in monographs of specialised research. We would hope that the Institute would provide the materials for enlightened treatment of Islamic civilisations in the liberal education of AKU students, and for as many other students and readers as these materials may reach.

**3.10** This educational programme of the AKU Institute would have much in common with the “civilisation” courses that developed strongly in higher education in the United States in the decades following World War II.<sup>19</sup> The Commission believes that these courses may be a source of helpful indications about what may be developed in AKU. They have presented the civilisations of the Western world, East Asia, Africa and other regions, cultures and times in a comprehensive fashion, depicting their achievements, their institutions, and their interactions with other civilisations. We should suppose there might well be a similar scope in what this Institute may develop on Islamic civilisations for the educational benefit of AKU and other students.

There should be exposure in this kind of education to the great artistic and intellectual achievements of Islamic civilisations, to the glories of the Alhambra and the Taj, and the minds of Ibn Rushd and Ibn Sina. There are reasons for a prominent place of the arts and humanities in the kind of education in Islamic civilisations we are envisaging, but it should be complemented by solid understanding of institutions and their history, and sober depiction of flaws and limitations.<sup>20</sup> Since the rise of the European hegemony in the 17th and 18th centuries, the history of Islamic civilisations has inevitably been deeply engaged with its Western encounters. There is thus a sense in which there is less need for education in the Islamic heritage to be de-parochialised, as Western education has had to be. But since the relations of

<sup>19</sup> Discussed at more length in a paper prepared for the September 1993 meeting of the Commission in London, entitled “Possible Strategies for AKU towards improving the understanding of Islam and Muslim societies”

<sup>20</sup> In an interesting and original work on Indian civilisation, Richard Lannoy begins with art, but remarks, “Any picture of Indian civilisation obtained from an examination of works of art alone must be incomplete, and too favourable”. *The Speaking Tree/A Study of Indian Culture and Society*, Oxford 1971, p.3.

---

Islam and the West have been and remain so emotionally charged, the presentation of Islamic civilisations in their wider contexts present difficulties that will test the mettle of the AKU's Institute.

3.11 We do not intend to give the Institute of Islamic Civilisations a solely educational mission, either in the unspecialised form we have been discussing, or in the training of specialists through graduate studies. We see needs for it to provide **research, scholarship, and analysis on many matters that now gravely concern the Muslim world and the world at large.** Such matters as the building of civil societies in Islamic contexts, the special problems of governance in Muslim societies, or the relations of Islamic values to economic, scientific, and technical performances are of fundamental importance but we do not find they receive as thoughtful and persistent attention from within the Muslim world as they ought to. They are matters difficult to illuminate helpfully. But working in the context of AKU, with other branches lending strength in such fields as economic development, and with a freedom other Muslim institutions do not have, this AKU Institute may be able to make unique contributions.

The utility of this Institute ought not be confined to the Muslim world and its own problems. We have suggested that there is a potential in the Islamic heritage that may help modern societies cope with the confusions, disillusionments, and moral vagaries that afflict them. The strident critique of modernity from the fundamentalists should not be the only voice from the Muslim world. There is the germ of a difficult but important mission of this Institute in the phrase "the Islamisation of modernity". We may hope that it will generate ideas and understanding important not only for Muslims but for the world at large.

### 3.12 *The Design and Location of the AKU Institute*

Within these broad conceptions of purpose and mission, what form should this Institute take? We repeat that we do not think the Commission should try to offer a detailed blueprint, but leave that task to later planners. We offer, however, some general conceptions that have emerged in our deliberations.

We believe that the conditions of intellectual freedom in which this Institute must work indicate that it should be located in a Western country. Regrets that this should be so have been expressed in the Commission's discussions without, however, leading to a different conclusion. Locations in Europe and North America have been considered, with a clear preference for Europe and for London in particular.

The Institute can begin effectively as a modest sized unit of the University; and, since we envisage its mission as primarily research and scholarship, it need not grow very large in the coming years. We have thought it might begin with three senior scholars and two juniors, and might grow in a few years to about ten staff, roughly equally distributed between seniors and juniors. Provision for visiting researchers and professors would be important to complement the special strengths of the longer-term staff and to encourage linkages to other institutions. There would be Institute fellows from the beginning, either at pre- or post-doctoral levels, and we foresee that some graduate students associated with AKU might profitably follow the degree programme we have described at Cambridge University. We should think that the Institute would develop graduate programmes of its own only rather slowly, and probably in conjunction with other centres of study on Islamic civilisations. We would hope that in the longer term AKU would be in a position to offer graduate degrees of its own in this field, but the demands on the Institute for research and writing, and the limited employment opportunities of graduates in its field suggest that this ambition should not be hurriedly pursued.

We would think it important that the Institute establish appropriate linkages with IIS and Cambridge but also with other universities and research centres in the Western and Muslim worlds. Connections to the Aga Khan Program for Islamic Architecture at Harvard and MIT would be natural and important to establish. Among the early activities of the Institute we should suppose that the holding of symposia on conceptions and pedagogy on Islamic civilisations would be fruitful and appropriate. These would naturally bring collaboration with the activities and contacts of the Aga Khan Trust for Culture. Through such symposia and other means, opportunities may arise or be sought out for jointly sponsored

projects with other universities. These may be promising ways to build relationships in the Muslim world, and to strengthen the Institute's impact by joining with others' resources.

Manifestly, we are proposing high and difficult tasks for AKU in these recommendations for fulfilling its mission as a Muslim university. The demands on the Institute's formative leadership will be exacting, intellectually, organisationally, and diplomatically. What we are proposing is no routine walk down a well-trodden academic path. Much lies ahead that will require vision, energy, and judgement. Perhaps the most critical determinant of the Institute's success will be the quality of the initial leadership AKU can attract for it. The recognised world importance of what AKU is here undertaking and its exceptional qualifications for the task make us optimistic that talent of the requisite high order can be acquired. We are confident that there will be encouragement, financial and otherwise, to AKU from various quarters in launching this undertaking. We defer until the next Section of our report most of what we have to say on the governance and financing of this component of the future AKU. But we assume that the leader of the Institute - "director" or "dean" or whatever he or she may be labelled - will want and need ways of relating to other parts of the University (some of them very far away !) as well as a council or advisory group specifically concerned with the Institute. We also assume there will be many questions of external relationships, not least to IIS, which will evolve over the years and are now difficult to anticipate, but need to be kept in mind in our own governance proposals and in the minds of those who will come after us in more detailed planning for the Institute.

**3.13** A final word about hazards and opportunities. A part of AKU that is concerned with Islam can never be invulnerable to criticisms or suspicions that it is posing as an interpretative authority, and this vulnerability may affect adversely other parts of the University. Such risks have been prominent in our minds and they are by no means removed by prudent location and "non-normative" principles. But rewards come with risks. AKU's distinction and prestige will be heightened particularly if its endeavours to find paths toward the "Islamisation of modernity" show promise of bearing fruit in the present setting, when such a contribution is the need of the hour.

## C.4 *An Institute of Human Development*

**4.1** The word "development" is sufficiently abstract to have a rich and confusing abundance of referents. In one of its meanings, "development" has been a word of hope and purpose for most of humankind in our times. The older idea of progress was transmuted into the idea of development in the aspirations of governments and peoples in the years since the Second World War.<sup>21</sup> In quite other (though ultimately related senses) "development" has biological referents. Harvard has a Department of Cellular and Developmental Biology and similar labels stud the course catalogues of universities everywhere. The extraordinary progress in molecular biology, genetics and other subjects in this century has enriched and complicated understanding of the evolution of species and the development of organisms over their life cycles.

**4.2** The idea of "human development" has roots in both these usages. The vision of development for nations and societies was at first a vision of economic growth, made possible by the diffusion of modern knowledge and organisation. The rise of national income accounting made possible the use of Gross National Product per capita as a central measure of economic development. There were always some dissatisfactions with this centrality of economic concepts and measures, and "human development" has emerged as a more comprehensive idea. It has now reached canonical international status in the Human Development Report of the United Nations Development Programme, which presents annually a statistical index of human development for each country. This index combines GNP per capita with two other measures, life expectancy at birth and literacy level, thus extending the idea of development to embrace measures of health and education.

"Human development" in the sense related to the life-cycle from conception to death has been a subject of practical and scientific attention from time long past. It has had biological, medical, psychological, educational and other foci in various combinations in different programmes. There have been, for examples, the well-known and influential Committee on Human Development at the University of Chicago, which had roots in the Progressive Education movement and has been

<sup>21</sup> Cf. H.W. Arndt, *Economic Development: The History of an Idea*, Chicago, 1987; also, F.X. Sutton, "Development Ideology" pp.33-56 in ed. Sutton, *A World to Make/Development in Perspective*, New Brunswick, NJ, 1990.

dominated by psychologists and social scientists; a (not altogether successful) transformation at Pennsylvania State University of its Home Economics College into a College of Health and Human Development; the Max Planck Institute of Human Development in Berlin; the Human Development Program at the Canadian Institute for Advanced Research; the (U.S.) Social Science Research Council Committee on Life-Course Perspectives on Human Development. All of these programmes have involved some intermixture of the biological, psychological and social sciences. Recent progress in these branches of knowledge, and particularly in the biological sciences, has opened new perspectives that have captured the Commission's attention.

**4.3 The inter-relations between human development as social progress and the development of individual members of society** have been perennial moral, religious, as well as less elevated concerns of thoughtful people. In this last half-century of development programmes and theories, there has been general appreciation that development of societies requires healthy, educated populations, and this appreciation has been given scientific elaboration in such forms as the human capital theories we have noted earlier. One of our members, Dr. J. Fraser Mustard, has fostered much work on these matters at the Canadian Institute of Advanced Research. He has brought to the Commission's attention some of the remarkable advances in recent years in our understanding of these inter-relationships. They make a strong case for the view that there is an **excellent opportunity for AKU to make a major contribution to development policy and practice through a programme in human development.** Such a programme would build on AKU's existing work in health and education and would complement in essential ways another thrust at the problems of development that we are proposing in an Institute of Economic Growth and Society (cf. C.5 below).

#### **4.4 *Research Findings on Human Development***

The arguments and evidence that have impressed us deserve some exposition as justification for our recommendations. There is, first, the accumulating understanding of the interactions between economic growth and the health and longevity of populations. Following on

the influential studies of McKeown there has been a new understanding that the historic improvement in health and life expectancy in Western populations was not simply due to gains in medical care and public health measures, but also depended on rising incomes and consequently better nutrition and living conditions.<sup>22</sup> And conversely, the importance of improved health and well-being for raising economic productivity and growth is stressed in the World Bank's Development Reports, where the 'burden of disease' is quantified in an index.

In his 1993 Nobel Prize lecture, the Chicago economic historian, Robert W. Fogel, presented a remarkable theory that since 1700 a "synergism between technological and physiological improvements has produced a form of human evolution, much more rapid than natural selection, which is still ongoing in both OECD and developing countries".<sup>23</sup> Fogel's argument for this bold thesis is based largely on data from Europe (where the longest and most adequate statistical series exist). He asserts that "for many European nations before the middle of the 19th century, the national production of food was at such low levels that the poorer classes were bound to have been malnourished under any conceivable circumstances". [p.4] Data on available calories indicate that the majority of adult males in all classes must have been small and light in the 18th century and existing data on height shows they were still "stunted" in modern comparison by 1860. Twenty per cent of the population of France in 1790 was so poorly nourished that they could either not work regularly or could do at most three hours a day of light work. In this lecture, Fogel reports his earlier calculation that improved nutrition and the consequent increased labour intensity accounted for 30% of the growth of per capita income in Britain between 1790 and 1980 [pp.17-18]; he extends his calculations in this Nobel lecture by taking into account the physiological improvement in efficient use of food energy by healthy, better nourished individuals, and concludes that **the combination would account for a full 50% of British economic growth since 1790.** [p.24]

Guided by the work of Scrimshaw and others on the relations between nutrition and infection, Fogel argues that "the high disease rates of the period (to the mid-19th century) were not merely a cause of malnutrition but undoubtedly,

<sup>22</sup> McKeown, T., *The Modern Rise of Population*, New York, 1976. The World Bank's 1993 Development Report, *Investing in Health* explains the extraordinary increase in life expectancy in the developing countries from 40 in 1950 to 63 in 1990 "in part because of growing incomes and increasing education ... and in part because of governments' efforts to expand health services ... [that have exploited] technological progress". [p.1 Later, p. 23, the Report says the mortality declines in the last 40 years in both the high-income and developing countries were mostly due to control of communicable diseases, particularly those of childhood.]

<sup>23</sup> "Economic Growth, Population Theory, and Physiology: The Bearing of Long-Term Processes on the Making of Economic Policy", National Bureau of Economic Research Working Paper # 4638, Cambridge, Mass, February 1994, pp.38 plus tables and figures. Quotation is from the Abstract.

to a considerable degree, a consequence of exceedingly poor diet". [p.4] He then presents extensive evidence that malnutrition in early childhood leads to increased vulnerability not only to infectious but also to chronic diseases. He shows in particular that stunting is correlated with increased mortality. His dramatic assertion that a new form of human evolution has emerged, describes a process in which human beings have increased notably in size, reduced their vulnerability to disease, and hence achieved still-continuing increases in life expectancy.

Qualified critics have found exaggerations in Fogel's conclusions (as they did in his earlier work on the physical conditions of slaves in the United States), but they could withstand considerable discounting and still remain of great importance for the problems of the developing countries. The widespread prevalence of malnutrition in the developing world points to heavy and lasting deficits in the human energies needed for economic growth; and these are disabilities that are being carried into the future. For nations seeking development they powerfully emphasise the critical importance of the health and energy of their populations.

Fogel's emphasis on the long-lasting effects of malnutrition in small children seems particularly ominous. It is reinforced in importance by an abundance of evidence, neurological, physiological, and psychological. This evidence shows that there are sensitive periods in early life in which the genetic potential of human beings must be developed in a timely way through appropriate stimulation and nurturance. The understanding of vision has been particularly advanced by research in recent years. There is a particular period in early life when stimuli from the eye must be received in the cortex of the brain for the genetic machinery to be turned on and certain cells to develop as the visual cortex; and continuing stimulation is then needed for a fully functional visual cortex to develop. Similar patterns of timely development for the other sensory functions of the cerebral cortex are thought to exist, and likewise, in more complex ways, other patterns for cognition and behaviour. Strengthening understanding of the neurological bases of behaviour have made it clear why deprivations or stress at these critical early periods lead to disabilities that are very difficult or impossible to remove later.

A Carnegie Corporation Task Force on Meeting the Needs of Young Children this year summarised the results of recent advances in these fields of research in five points :

*"First, the brain development that takes place before age one is more rapid and extensive than we previously realised;*

*"Second, brain development is much more vulnerable to environmental influences than we ever suspected;*

*"Third, the influence of early environment on brain development is long lasting;*

*"Fourth, the environment affects not only the number of brain cells and number of connections among them, but also the way these connections are 'wired';*

*"And fifth, we have new scientific evidence for the negative impact of early stress on brain function."* [from *The Quiet Crisis*, the report of the Task Force, pp.7-9.]

The forms and types of environmental influence that can affect brain development are many. Nutrition is obviously important but there are also social influences of critical importance. For example, evidence going back to the disruptions of World War II have shown that children left too much of the time during the first part of their lives simply lying in their cribs develop abnormally. As Keating and Fraser Mustard write, "children must be stimulated through visual, tactile and auditory and other stimuli to develop fully".<sup>24</sup> Social environments that are impoverished or unstable are particularly likely to provide poor support for early development; many of the interventions that have been undertaken to enrich the early support of young children have been directed at poor populations in urban ghettos and other depressed areas.

There have been repeated demonstrations that such interventions with pre-school children have important and lasting results. The great bulk of experimentation of this sort has been done in the United States, notably in the Head Start programme that was part of the War on Poverty. This programme has not been free from controversy but has survived extensive critical evaluations by more than its political appeal.

<sup>24</sup> "The National Forum on Family Security/Social Economic Factors and Human Development", Canadian Institute for Advanced Study, August 1993, p.11.

Follow-up studies have continued to show important positive effects from these and other programmes enriching children's environment and experience in the first years of life. The well-known High/Scope Perry Pre-school Project in Ypsilanti, Michigan brought a "high-quality, active learning" pre-school programme to children from African-American families, living in poverty. By the 1990s the children who were randomly divided into "programme" and "no-programme" groups had been followed to age 27. Striking (and statistically significant) differentials have been found in monthly earnings, home-ownership, levels of schooling completed, demands on social services, teenage pregnancies and numbers of arrests. The "programme" group showed consistently better performance not only through their school years but as they went on to cope with the demands of adult life.<sup>25</sup> The High/Scope study has thus shown in impressive particulars that the effects of early interventions can be long lasting. Most of such programmes have been in the rich, industrial countries but Keating and Mustard cite a successful intervention in poor social environments in Jamaica, and members of the Commission some years ago observed an impressive programme in Colombia.

There have undoubtedly been more studies and intervention programmes on child development than there have been studies of the full span of the human life-course (just as there are more schools than adult education programmes). But the detection of effects alone requires that Human Development studies extend into later years of the life-cycle (as the High/Scope study helpfully does). And it is evident that there are sequences of development through adolescence into adulthood and old age that need better understanding in a world where populations are living longer and are increasingly exposed to changes that require continuous learning or a backlog of learning that helps keep life together. For example, a recent survey of studies showed that people around the world with low levels of education were more likely to fall victims of clinical dementia as they grow older.<sup>26</sup> There is also a growing number of studies in Europe and the United States showing that people in higher socio-economic statuses and corresponding social environments are less vulnerable to diseases and benefit more easily from educational opportunities than those farther down the social

scale. The grave disadvantages of growing up in U.S. urban ghettos are painfully familiar; other studies now generalise the influence of social environment and status to make a presumption that they have everywhere impacts on health and learning that have been poorly perceived and too little considered in the making of policy.

#### 4.5 *Human Development as a Field for AKU*

The accumulation of knowledge we have been surveying has mostly been gained in the rich, industrial countries. Much of it is biological evidence that should apply to human beings wherever they may be and in whatever sort of culture. But there is evident need to extend both research and intervention programmes in the developing and Muslim worlds. The scale of deprivations that afflict these worlds is far greater than the deprivations of poverty and disadvantage that have aroused the U.S. and other countries to study and action. There is, as we have suggested, a prospect of spreading new understanding of the critical importance to economic progress of a healthy, alert population. Such understanding could be reinforcement to family planning and other programmes that give better chances to on-coming generations.

Heightened awareness of the costs of malnourishment and apathy in early life need not be a cause of despair even in poor countries where these conditions are massively prevalent. Amartya Sen has emphasised that there is no simple relationship between wealth and life-expectancies, which are lower in Saudi Arabia than they are in the Indian state of Kerala, and lower for American black males than they are in China and Kerala.<sup>27</sup> The possibility that programmes in education, health and nutrition can notably lift the well-being of very poor populations has been amply demonstrated. And the fact that education and health programmes are typically labour-intensive ones means that such programmes are relatively affordable in poor countries with low labour costs. There is, consequently, a hopeful case that knowledge and demonstrations of the value of programmes for better human development may stimulate efforts that will be highly beneficial to the general welfare and be within the reach of poor countries.

<sup>25</sup> Cf. J.J. Schweinhart, Helen V. Barnes, and David P. Weikart, *Significant Benefits/The High/Scope Perry Pre-school Study Through Age 27*. The High/Scope Press, Monograph # 10.

<sup>26</sup> Cited by Clyde Hertzman and Michele Wiens in a Can. Inst. of Adv. Research paper, "Child Development and Long-Term Outcomes", March, 1994, p.5. The paper in question is by R. Katzman, "Education and the prevalence of dementia and Alzheimer's disease", *Neurology* 43, 1993, pp.13-20.

<sup>27</sup> Amartya Sen, "The Economics of Life and Death", *Scientific American*, May 1993, pp.40-47.

AKU already has beginnings in many of the disciplines needed for a rounded programme in human development. In the Faculty of Health Sciences, it has professionals in paediatrics, psychiatry, psychology, epidemiology, community health sciences, sociology, endocrinology and immunology.<sup>28</sup> As we discussed in looking toward the future of Education in AKU, IED has brought educational professionals to AKU who would be needed for human development. Still other fields will need to be added, in neurosciences, economics, anthropology, developmental psychology, and possibly in nutrition and computer science if AKU is to be well-positioned to deal with this subject. Present staff in the Faculty of Health Sciences and IED are already heavily burdened with their responsibilities and we have been warned that most of them could not take on new responsibilities in human development. But we have been encouraged that new staff particularly concerned with this subject would have the reinforcement of colleagues in their own fields. And we note that others will come along as the existing parts of the University and new ones such as the Institute of Economic Growth and Society grow over the years.

What would an AKU Institute of Human Development do? It would:

(1) In the first place, be a **strong research programme** providing from within the developing and Muslim worlds the kind of studies we have cited earlier and that have been done overwhelmingly in the rich, industrial countries.

This research programme would include multi-disciplinary studies embracing the numerous fields described above and relating human development to health and well-being, school and occupational performance. It would reach out, with the help of AKF, AKES and AKHS into different cultural, social and economic settings. It would probe matters of special interest in the Muslim world such as the significance of different treatment of boys and girls.

(2) It would undertake **properly controlled and rigorously researched demonstrations** on the sorts of interventions that can diminish the handicapping effects of poor

environments and deprivation. Such demonstrations might be primarily under the responsibility of related parts of the University such as Community Health Sciences, or IED (or whatever label the Education component of AKU may ultimately bear) with this Institute bearing principally research and evaluation responsibilities.

(3) By dissemination of its work, consultations, and other means, it would seek to **influence health, education and other policies** across the developing and Muslim worlds. Its efforts to this purpose would presumably benefit from active collaboration with the Institute of Economic Growth and Society that we are also proposing for AKU.

(4) It would **provide training for a significant number of graduate students** who would go on to complete their degrees in one of the fields embraced in the programme, with a specialty in Human Development. In the longer run, it seems to us possible that degree programmes in human development may be developed.

(5) The staff of the Institute would **provide instruction** to students in nursing, medicine, education, and ultimately in other fields and faculties that may develop in AKU.

The number of additional staff needed to make this Institute a creative and productive unit of AKU will depend on its proximity to other units. The obvious conclusion is that it must be started in Karachi in close relationship with the Faculty of Health Sciences and IED. If, over the course of some years' development, the education programmes of AKU shift toward East Africa, as we have suggested they might, the Institute of Human Development might follow a similar shift. It should in any case have an international and comparative reach from its inception, if its research and scientific depth are to be maximised.

We are conscious in this, as in other parts of the Commission's report, that the University will not stand still. The approval by the Board of Master's Degree programmes in Epidemiology and Health Policy and Management as we were coming toward the completion of our report has been a

<sup>28</sup> The closeness of Community Health Sciences to Human Development has been evident and the Commission has received a paper, by Prof. Mehtab Karim of that department, proposing a Centre for Studies in Human Development in AKU.

---

reminder that the AKU matrix within which the Institute will fit will be a changing one. If it is to be as well-defined and significant a part of AKU as we think it ought to be, it will be important that its start be not long delayed and that it have a sufficient scale to keep its identity. We have estimated that 6 to 10 new faculty, in addition to the contributions of otherwise existing staff, will be needed for the Institute. The number of graduate students or post-doctoral fellows could vary considerably but might be as many as 24 at a time. It will also be important to the scientific vigour and broad perspective of an Institute in this complex subject matter to have excellent linkages with human development centres in other parts of the world. Some of this may be achieved through the information and communication resources we are strongly urging for AKU's future; but reinforcement through a network of continuing relationships with specialists in this field at other institutions is recommended.

We believe there is reason for optimistic views on AKU's capability to assemble the necessary talent and resources for this Institute. Farther along, in Sections VIII and IX of our Report we will attempt to justify these views and say how and when we think the Institute may start.

---

### C.5 *An Institute of Economic Growth and Society*

5.1 Earlier in this report, we have argued that the mission of AKU to serve the developing world ought not to be diminished in the foreseeable future. The needs of huge populations in the developing countries remain grave and difficult, worthy of AKU's commitment and such educational and analytical powers as it can muster.

There are many ways for AKU to carry out its mission to serve the developing world. It is already doing so in health and education and the future we have depicted would deepen and strengthen these commitments in several ways. The Institute of Islamic Civilisations is particularly concerned with the Muslim world and should certainly illuminate ways to its contemporary development; and the Institute of Human Development is broadly devoted to making better lives for the human beings who populate developing societies and provide their human energies.

One of the Commission's tasks has been to ask : What else ? In one sense, practically all we are proposing serves AKU's mission to the developing world. But we now turn our attention to a component (or components) of AKU that would address the challenges of development more strategically and frontally.

5.2 We recall an earlier section of this report (Section IV.3) in which we have described the remarkable changes in conceptions of development and the developing world that have come about in recent decades. It is one of the curiosities of social and intellectual history that there was very little attention to the subject of economic growth in this century until after the Second World War. The public mind and the minds of economists were then focused on business cycles and the distribution of wealth. [cf. H. W. Arndt, *The Rise and Fall of Economic Growth*, Chicago, 1978] After the War, the tasks in the official title of the World Bank - "reconstruction" and "development" - became dominant concerns all over the world. The liberation of nations from colonial subjection and the application of egalitarian principles to peoples everywhere brought forth aspirations of universal economic progress and there was confidence that it was quickly possible. President Truman in Point Four proclaimed one essential basis of that confidence : the diffusion of the technical and scientific knowledge that had made some countries rich to those still poor. For whatever reasons, the years after World War II saw what Professor Lloyd Reynolds has called the "greatest boom in history". Both rich and poor countries grew at rates that were historically unprecedented and economists and statesmen could be excused for thinking they understood at least some of the principles of economic development.

As Professor Bell has described in a paper prepared for the Commission, a subject called "economic development", which focused on the economies of underdeveloped countries, grew up and flourished for 20 to 30 years. This subject no longer has a distinct status in the corpus of economic knowledge; loss of faith in economic planning and the state as a prime agent of development was an important reason; a heightened conviction that the conditions of economic progress are essentially the same in all

countries is another. Both of these reasons were, of course, related to revived faith in the market. The former has also contributed to a faith in private organisations and initiatives of many sorts, as exemplified in the efforts of public development aid agencies and private foundations to reach past governments and deal directly with "the people". The strategies of the Aga Khan Foundation exemplify these policies.

We are thus now in an era when macroscopic consideration of the whole economies and societies of developing countries is less popular than it was a decade ago. It is of course inevitable that governments and international agencies like the World Bank and IMF must do so, but the exercises are little applauded. If governments are generally unpopular, the World Bank and IMF are even less so among the citizenries of developing countries and the international 'development community'. Denunciations of pernicious structural adjustment programmes are everyday rhetoric and a movement has even been mounted to get IMF back "where it belongs", out of development.

**5.3** Despite all this change, **the fundamental importance of economic growth for the future well-being of the peoples of the earth has not changed.** If the developing countries of the world are to lift their populations out of abject poverty, there is no other course than to raise incomes per capita. And at present rates of growth it will be a very long time before massive poverty is eased. In describing the plight of Africa earlier, we noted the dismaying calculations that it would take at least 40 years at rates of growth optimistically projected by the World Bank for average incomes in tropical Africa to get back to the low levels they had attained in the mid-1970s. Also, at its average rate of growth from 1980 to 1991 (3.2%) it would take Pakistan about 14 years to reach the present per capita income of Indonesia and more than 30 to reach Jordan's - to mention no more prosperous targets for comparisons.

**5.4** Whatever the unpopularity of macroscopic views of the growth of economies, the need for them seems inescapable. The effect of changing perceptions of conditions and strategies for economic growth has certainly not been to make the paths to prosperity look easier. There is a set of fundamental issues that need to be faced and clarified :

- In the first place, there is the question **why there should be such large disparities** in rates of growth in different regions with different cultural backgrounds.

- These disparities are clearly related **to political stability and effectiveness of government.** Whatever the arguments over the role of the "developmental state" in the successes of the East Asian "tigers" no one doubts that an effective political frame has been a necessary condition for the successes of these burgeoning economies. Conversely, the "softness" of African governments has been seen as "the dominant single cause of the [economic] crisis".<sup>29</sup> Similarly, we have noted the common view that the economic future of Pakistan depends more on the stability and effectiveness of its government than on underlying economic conditions. With old dispositions to an economic determinism that would make good government flow from economic development now in retreat, the problems of economic growth now become entangled with the problems of achieving good governance.

- Heightened awareness of the essential role of a governmental and legal frame for economic growth has been generalised to **other institutional frameworks for economic activities.** As Professor Bell puts it, "To achieve sustained economic growth in any society requires, in this view, deep understanding of the institutional basis of economic activity and creative thinking about how to modify institutional frameworks". Among these, **frameworks that make possible exploiting the potential of scientific and technological advance are crucial.** Whatever else is clear about the history of economic growth the central place of technical progress stands out. As we have argued earlier (in Section IV) lagging scientific and technical competences are a serious handicap for the developing and Muslim world in their pursuit of economic growth. Remedying this lack is not simply a matter of training appropriate talent, but of institutional development as well. Other institutional developments are needed for the reconciliation of private and collective interests, for constraining the grosser forms of rapacity and greed, and more broadly, for promoting growth with equity.

<sup>29</sup> D.K. Fieldhouse in a review of ed. John Ravenhill, *Africa in Economic Crisis*, (Macmillan, 1986), in *Times Literary Supplement* p. 1420, December 19, 1986.

---

There has, moreover, been a rising awareness that environmental conditions and resources must be respected in strategies of economic growth. The environmental destruction that heedless economic development has produced in the ex-USSR and elsewhere have made evident that "sustainable economic growth" is more than a popular slogan, and is a requirement of sound policy. As the Rio de Janeiro Conference proclaimed last year, the pursuit of economic growth and environmental protection are fatefully intertwined.

5.5 Laying forth these complex inter-relations of economic growth with governance, institution-building, and environmental protection is to present a daunting array of challenges. There may be understandable dispositions to think that AKU is too modest an institution to tackle such large questions. We do, however, believe it should not shirk the challenge and should address the frontier issues in economic growth in their presently perceived complexity, giving particular attention to the Muslim world and the interactions between its history and culture and its contemporary institutions and problems.

5.6 A fully comprehensive agenda covering all the determinants and conditions of growth might be overwhelming. At various stages in the Commission's deliberations we have given particular attention to one or another of the subjects set forth above. The question of governance of Muslim and developing societies has repeatedly entered our discussions. We have considered and rejected the idea of proposing a special component of AKU devoted to governance or public administration [see Section VII C.8 below], seeking AKU's contributions on these vital matters in other ways, such as what the Institute of Islamic Civilisations may do for the education of citizens in Muslim societies and for the understanding of their governance problems. Similarly we have explored the idea of institutes of architecture and development that would be engaged in spatial planning and environmental questions [see below, Section VII C.6]. AKU's efforts in the generic problems of development would thus be scattered in different parts of the University, rather than being entrusted to a single component.

5.7 We believe, nonetheless, that AKU should establish an "Institute on Economic Growth and Society" that would be very broadly concerned with the major determinants of development. It would have a core group of economists but would be freely interdisciplinary. It would conduct research and writing, and offer post-graduate training, beginning with short courses and workshops, and later adding Masters and Doctors degrees as need and feasibility indicate. The Institute should actively seek consulting and advisory contracts and engage in policy and programme issues. We believe it could begin at a modest size, with two senior and half a dozen junior staff (these latter as junior faculty, post- or pre-doctoral students). We would expect it to double its staff over the years as its activities grow.

5.8 Depending upon location, such an Institute could serve as the nucleus of a broader AKU competence in economic policy and analysis. The Commission has been concerned that AKU is rapidly becoming engaged in matters of health and educational policy which require economic competencies it does not now have. The growth of the already starting programme in Health Policy and Management will sharpen the need for such competencies. If the Institute we are proposing were located in Karachi it could, with suitable expansion serve as a general locus of economic competencies for the University.

There will also be broader needs for instruction in economics as liberal arts education grows in AKU. The broadened educational programme we envisage for the Faculty of Health Sciences, and the College of Arts and Sciences that we expect to come along later, should have good basic courses in economics that will require qualified professors. In the continuing education functions in various fields that we envisage as an important part of AKU's future activities, instruction in economics should certainly have a place. It might even happen that at some point in the future the Institute of Economic Growth and Society would be linked to a (suitably non-traditional) department of economics in AKU.

5.9 The Harvard Report recommended a Centre or School of Development Policy and Management for AKU and proposed that it be located in Kenya, with a site in India as a possible

---

alternative. Despite some advantages, just reviewed, of a Karachi location, this Commission is disposed to favour an East African location for the Institute we are proposing, again with the possibility of India as an alternative. It would seem likely that Kenya might emerge as a preferred location in East Africa, but we emphasise that we conceive this Institute as having an international outlook and vocation; it would naturally be attentive to the regional ties that will be important to Africa's economic growth and that are given new scope by reliance on open, market economies.

Our conception of the Institute of Economic Growth and Society would put more emphasis on research and policy than management, though certainly not to the exclusion of the latter. As we suggested above, the AKU's Institute should have its educational impact in its first years through short courses, workshops and seminars, particularly with middle- and senior-level people, avoiding the large scale investment that would be involved in a full-fledged school of management. We would of course want to see the Institute making serious contributions to the economic growth of Muslim societies and to the South Asian region. Both these objectives raise the prospect that the Institute would need to have a secondary locus in South Asia.

5.10 Wherever located, the Institute we are proposing should be well linked to other parts of AKU, to AKDN, and to universities and research centres throughout the world. We would think there is a natural two-way relationship between an AKU centre concerned with economic growth and the Aga Khan Fund for Economic Development, to their mutual benefit. Reaching beyond AKDN, it would be essential that AKU establish good relations with some of the world's leading groups dealing with sustainable economic growth. The Canadian Institute for Advanced Research's group on economic growth and the UNU's World Institute of Development Economics Research in Helsinki come to mind as attractive possibilities. Visiting appointments at both senior and junior levels would be important means of establishing and sustaining such linkages.

5.11 Such an Institute could not deal with all of the conditions and aspects of economic growth that we identified above. But we would hope that

it would contribute significantly on subjects that are not the normal business of economic analysis centres and that require the broad interdisciplinary outlook we believe it should have. We would hope in particular that this Institute might make significant contributions on the subject of **governance**, not solely in technical questions of the making of economic policy but on such matters as the costs of corruption and clientelism, and means of controlling them. The special questions of economics in Muslim societies would be a natural focus of attention, and their study might be facilitated by being placed in an international Muslim university, not beholden to a single government. The possibilities of bringing environmental considerations into the Institute's analyses would seem to be inevitably numerous, but AKU may in the longer run wish to have more focused attention on them, as would be one of the features of a component to which we now turn.

---

## C.6 *An Institute of Planning and Management of Human Settlements*

6.1 One of the fields specifically suggested to the Commission for possible inclusion in a future AKU was **architecture**. We have briefly described (in Section V.5 above) the various activities in this field that have been sponsored for many years by the Aga Khan and that make it natural to ask what role AKU could or should take in this field. When the Commission reviewed the field with the help of Harvard-MIT staff and the AKTC General Manager at its Third Meeting in May 1993, it found itself engaged not only with architecture but with other fields that, as the Chairman said, sheltered under the "broad eaves" of architecture. Urban and rural planning, the economic and social processes of urban and rural change, environmental problems and the relations of the built environment to development all came into view. The possibility thus appeared of an **approach to development problems through architecture, the environment, both built and natural, and planning**.

6.2 We have recommended above the early establishment in AKU of an Institute of Islamic Civilisations. This Institute will certainly be engaged in important ways with Islamic architecture, it being unthinkable that Islamic

culture could be presented without one of its greatest glories. The focus in this Institute will be on education, scholarship and research; we trust that it will grow up in strong relationships with Harvard, MIT, and other leading centres devoted to Islamic art and architecture, ultimately assuming a respected place among them. The Institute, as we conceive it, will not be concerned with the professional practice or training of architects or with much of the set of related planning and development problems that came into our discussions "under the eaves" of architecture. The Commission has therefore asked what it might further propose that AKU undertake on these subjects.

**6.3** Persuasive arguments were heard by the Commission that **AKU should not engage in professional, first-degree education of architects.** While first-degree architectural education in the Muslim world is mostly not of good quality, it is very abundant and constrained by national rules and regulations that inhibit creative originality. What is needed for the future, the professionals thought, is a series of institutes, rooted in the cultural conditions of different regions of the Muslim world, where leaders of the professions in the regions could seek and find guidance. The idea of a series of **institutes of architecture and development** crystallised. There should be as many of these as there are distinctive cultural regions in the Muslim world, from North Africa to South East Asia. They would be devoted to research, graduate and advanced professional education. They should be closely related to planning and other concrete development projects in their regions; they consequently need to embrace professionals in urban and rural planning and other fields, as well as architects.

**6.4** This vision of a set of institutes of architecture and development was to meet the needs of the whole Muslim world over the coming generations. It clearly went beyond what AKU itself might attempt to do. But it seemed possible that AKU might develop one such institute in a particular region such as Central Asia; it might also act as a stimulus to the founding and growth of other institutes and serve as a link and resource for them. In further discussion of these ideas, the Commission has been conscious of needs to relate what AKU might

do, not only to the programmes of AKTC, but to other activities in AKDN, such as the Rural Support Programmes of AKF and the Housing Boards. The University itself is already engaged through its community health programmes with the *katchi abadis* of Karachi and is bound to have general concerns with the environmental and planning problems of the vast metropolis within which most of its present activities lie. Close at hand, in the Dawood College of Engineering and Technology, an AKTC-supported programme in urban design has already produced instructive analyses of Karachi's problems and the successes and failures in dealing with them<sup>30</sup>. There are evidently various ways in which AKU may broaden and deepen its concern with the problems of Karachi (and hence with Third World cities generally). It may contribute not only through exemplary projects in the *katchi abadis* but through providing better understanding of the economic, social, and environmental processes that affect these cities. The planning and management of its enormous cities is now one of the urgent generic problems of the developing world and a worthy subject for AKU's attention. Likewise, the rapid and ill-perceived changes occurring in rural areas beckon for better attention and understanding.

**6.5** As the Commission's discussion of these ideas has evolved, we have wanted to embrace concerns with both the built and the natural environments, and with urban and rural areas. We believe there is a coherent body of subject matter here that is similar to but broader than that which was originally proposed for institutes of architecture and development in the Muslim world. We now prefer a different title and **propose that AKU aim to include in its future an Institute for the Planning and Management of Human Settlements.** A suitable mix of architects, planners, and other professionals will be needed for the creative research, writing, consulting, and advanced professional training this Institute should provide.

**6.6** The Commission has discussed several approaches AKU might take to the complex subject of development, in addition to the sectoral approaches it already has and will continue to have in health and education. The approach just described through the spatial and communal settings of developing societies is one that would

<sup>30</sup> Cf. eds. Sumer Gurel, Kausar Bashir Ahmad, Muhammad Fazal Noor, and Khadija Jamal, *Housing Parameters*, Aga Khan Program for Architecture and Urban Design, Dawood College, Karachi, 1991, pp.307.

have the attractions of building on the established professional ties and reputation of the Aga Khan enterprises in architecture and historic preservation. We believe it can take an important place among AKU's future contributions to the developing world. But recognising that AKU cannot start many new enterprises at the same time, we have had to weigh priorities, and in this case particularly against the claims of the Institute of Economic Growth and Society proposed in C.5 above. Our conclusion has been that the latter should be given priority, and that **the Institute we are here proposing should only be started in the later years of the period we are looking ahead in proposing developments for AKU.** We have, correspondingly, not tried to specify its staffing and activities as closely as we have for components of AKU we propose should be added sooner. Much more detailed planning will have, of course, to be undertaken at the proper time. We do, however, conceive that this Institute will be roughly comparable in its core staffing and funding with other institutes we are proposing, and we so indicate when we come to financial estimates in Section VIII below. The location of this Institute ought, if possible, to extend the geographic spread of AKU. The Commission has discussed sites as far-flung as Central Asia and South East Asia, but has deferred a clear choice to our successors in shaping AKU's future.

6.7 As we have indicated earlier, the Commission's efforts to define a future for AKU in architecture and related subjects have been made with particular attention to the current programmes and plans of the Aga Khan Trust for Culture. We foresee many opportunities and mutual benefit in close relations between the Trust and the Institute of Islamic Civilisations. The strategic plans for AKTC's future which Professor de Monchaux shared with us (and that we described in Section V.5 above) include a programmatic concern with architectural education in the Muslim world that will undoubtedly provide much valuable guidance to AKU when the time comes for it to launch the sort of Institute we are here proposing. And we are also confident that the continuing accumulation of experience in the architectural awards and historic preservation programmes will enrich the understanding of planning needs that AKU will have.

## C.7 *A Faculty or College of Arts and Sciences*

7.1 In the vision of a future, 21st century, AKU which we presented in Section VI of this report we said that a Faculty or College of Arts and Sciences should be considered as one of its parts. The reasons, briefly summarised, were :

(1) the weaknesses in first-degree higher education in parts of the developing world of particular interest to AKDN and the Ismaili community;

(2) a sense of need for a broader education for AKU's present and future students in whatever field, and for many like them in the Muslim world;

(3) an appreciation that the contributions AKU can make to better understanding and presentation of Islamic culture and civilisations must be educational as well as scholarly; and

(4) a judgement that more important results may be achieved in the education of men and women for responsible careers through the liberal arts than through professional studies alone.

7.2 At a time when there is nearly universal concern, in both rich and poor countries, over the educated unemployed and persistent criticism is made of developing countries for spending too much of their educational budgets on higher education, the contemplation of an arts and science college as a component of AKU may raise eyebrows. We think, however, that the need and demand for higher education of better quality will persist and grow throughout the world, and in the Muslim and developing countries in particular. (We assume that AKU would only want to have an arts and sciences college if it were of distinctive character and quality.) There is ample evidence, familiar even to casual observers, on the efforts parents make to send their children to the best schools available at all levels and to offer them additional advantages in tutoring and other help wherever possible. The competition among graduates at every stage sharpens this search for education that leads to better chances at the next level of education or in the job market. We think this situation can only become more accentuated in the future and that there will be a growing demand for the first degree arts and science education that AKU might someday provide.

---

Equity requires that special educational advantages be paid for by those who gain them (or by their families and supporters) and hence that this sort of education be privatised in some form. AKU is of course in a good position as a private university to provide such superior education, but would not be comfortable if its fees excluded all but the very well-to-do. Keeping the doors open for those of large talent but small means, however, requires resources from endowment or current sources that can be very large. (The aim of leading American universities to maintain need-blind admission policies in their undergraduate colleges has fuelled massive fund-raising drives.) If only for these resource reasons, we do not think an undergraduate liberal arts college is something that AKU could or should develop quickly. We conceive it should grow slowly out of initiatives and experiments in other parts of AKU and the Aga Khan network of schools, in ways we sketch in following paragraphs.

7.3 Each of the reasons listed in 7.1 above for contemplating the eventual establishment of a faculty or college of liberal arts points toward transitional activities that may lead to it. A lack of opportunities for the specially talented in poor areas, such as Africa or Central Asia, stimulates ideas on special programmes or institutions that may form a bridge to higher education. In some instances these may be built around or upon existing secondary schools; in other cases they may be attached as a preparatory year or years to the university (as once was fairly common in Africa).

7.4 Such bridging or transitional programmes not only may serve to rescue talent otherwise too far from recognition and opportunity; they may also remedy the narrowness and weakness of preparation that has concerned the Medical College faculty. We are less well acquainted with the situation in secondary education across Asia and Africa but we are aware of distress in AKES at the thinness of the curriculum and the weak preparation it offers for coping with the modern world. A preparatory year or more before the regular Medical College curriculum begins has been under discussion and we believe this is an initiative that ought to be pursued. It may bring resistance from families facing longer burdens of support; but the Medical College now has an embarrassment of riches

in candidates and should be able to lose a considerable number of applicants without a detectable decline in average quality. (Some provision of financial help for exceptional but needy applicants would, of course, be required.)

7.5 The prospect of an Institute or Faculty especially concerned with Islam and its civilisations (cf. Section VII C.2 above) opens exciting prospects of a distinctive form of liberal arts education in AKU. As we have conceived this way of AKU's fulfilling its mission as a Muslim university, we have hoped it should have a very widespread educational impact, extending through all of AKU itself, and reaching further through writings and example. Such a goal must take time, for the development of courses and curricula, for writing and scholarship that will guide and support them, and for experiments that will not always succeed. **An arts and science college in AKU ought not emerge until it can have an original and appropriate Muslim character.**

7.6 The case for liberal education versus more specialised professional education seems to be strengthening with the rapidity of technological change, the world-wide sweep of business competition, and the intrusiveness of mass media. In a curious way, John Henry Cardinal Newman's **Idea of a University** is becoming popular again, even for the poorer countries. It has typically been said that the demand for education in the developing countries is a "derived demand" coming from the demand for a job. But if the link between a particular form of education and future jobs is loosened by change, the appeal of less evidently useful education grows, even on instrumental grounds. Stronger reasons for the indispensability of liberal education now surely come from the need for capacities to make the myriad adjustments modern life requires; these are capacities of intellectual, cultural and moral sorts that only general education can provide.

7.7 We have encountered strong aspirations for first-degree arts and science education in both Pakistan and East Africa. Indeed, we have heard proposals that AKU ought to have colleges, or branches of its college, in more than one location in Pakistan. While we have looked very sympathetically on East Africa's claims, we have concluded that Pakistan must be given priority. Assembling the resources for a

---

single AKU college will be a demanding undertaking, as we indicate in Section VIII below. Recognising the pressures for serving different countries, we cannot exclude the possibility that AKU may ultimately try to offer liberal arts in more than one location, but only after a long preparatory period.

7.8 We do not, in any case, see a Faculty or College of Arts and Sciences emerging quickly in AKU. There will certainly be pressures from parents and others for a quick start. Indeed, concern has been expressed in the Commission that the popular appeal of an AKU college might overwhelm developments we think more important to fulfilment of its mission as a distinguished university for the developing and Muslim worlds. But the likely course of development we have sketched above, building on university preparatory programmes at secondary schools, and a preliminary programme in the Faculty of Health Sciences, suggest that AKU will be well into the next century before it is fully launched in the liberal arts and sciences.

---

## C.8 *Other Fields or Components Considered*

It has been the Commission's responsibility to be very wide-ranging in its concerns. We have consequently considered more possibilities for AKU's future than we think it can embrace. We take comfort that some important subjects that we felt could not have a component of their own are addressed more than casually in ones we have proposed. But we should mention briefly here some possible components that we have seriously discussed but do not think we should include in our recommendations.

### 8.1 *An Institute or Faculty of Governance or Public Administration*

8.1.1 The Commission could not fail to be impressed with the gravity of the need for peace, public order, and good governance in the developing and Muslim worlds. The papers we have read included such gruesome facts as the conservative estimate that more than 12 million people have died in civil wars in the developing world since 1950, and that "the most important

cause of famine in developing countries in recent years has not been inadequate agricultural output or poverty, but military conflict" [World Development Report, 1991]. We have also been aware that massive disillusionment with the corruption and mismanagement of governments has been one of the major sources of the appeal of extremist movements. If we had not been sufficiently motivated ourselves by such observations, we were given a further stimulus to look at what AKU might do about governance problems by the Chancellor's request at our first meeting in Washington in October 1992.

8.1.2 A special paper, entitled "What AKU might do for better governance of Muslim societies" was discussed at the Commission's September 1993 meeting in London, and we have reverted to the subject many times in other meetings. The London paper distinguished four ways in which universities may affect political order and governance :

(1) through educating executives and professional specialists essential to the functioning of modern governments;

(2) by being a source of political ideas and experience for students;

(3) by providing political leadership for their countries; and

(4) by providing ideas, doctrines and scholarship that influence the political life of nation-states.

8.1.3 Enumerating the ways a university can have effects shows quickly that a special component to deal with the problems of governance might well neglect some of the most important things a university can do. We did discuss the recommendation of the Harvard Committee for a Centre or School of Development Planning and Management that would have had a substantial role in the training of civil servants and managers of public enterprises. We discussed without much enthusiasm the possibility that a small, private university such as AKU would be able to raise the professional competencies of public services. We were thus led away from a special component of AKU to deal with governance matters, to consider what the University might contribute through its various branches and components.

8.1.4 The prospects we see are encouraging. Recommendations we are making for broadening professional education in AKU and ultimately establishing a Faculty or College of Arts and Sciences are aimed at making better citizens and leaders for the countries AKU can affect. This is a diffuse and long-term process but not, we think, thereby inconsequential. Perhaps too much has been said and written about the playing fields of Eton or Mark Hopkins at the end of a log, but it would be to despair of one of the highest purposes of education to deny its influence on the quality of political leadership. We are confident that some of AKU's graduates in the next decades will have opportunities in political leadership and we think their education must not ignore this possibility. We also think that AKU will be able to contribute more immediately and tangibly to analysis and understanding of the problems of governance by the research and scholarship it promotes. The Institute of Islamic Civilisations would be disappointing if at some point it did not bring forth helpful and illuminating work on the governance of Muslim societies. And we have stressed the failures of government among the determinants of economic progress that the Institute of Economic Growth and Society would tackle. There are obviously some hazards for a university in venturing to tell how societies might be governed better (and there are perhaps even greater dangers of being quite ignored). But AKU could not shirk the challenges of finding ways toward better-governed societies without shirking its basic mission in service to the developing and Muslim worlds.

### 8.2 *A Department or Institute of Information and Computer Sciences*

We have seen abundant reasons for AKU to have first class competencies in the modern technologies of communication and information. We have argued that, as an international university it must make special efforts to stay on the "information superhighways" of the world. In each of the fields we have discussed above - including even the most traditional fields of the humanities - there are such pervasive effects of these new competencies that the staff and students of AKU will be under constant pressure to extend their knowledge and masteries. In the Health Sciences, *The Economist* in the survey cited earlier depicted veritable revolutions in surgery, diagnosis

and other fields and an indispensable set of linkages between any particular medical centre and others throughout the world. In research, whether in biomedical fields or in health systems and health policy, access to data, the literature of the fields, and analytic capacity require not only powerful computer resources but confident use of them. In architecture, the Harvard-MIT programme has already been through an ambitious (and premature) effort to make a library of images available throughout the world. New and better CD-ROM's will surely follow in this field as in others; and a stroll to the Dawood College of Engineering and Technology from the AKU campus quickly shows how indispensable computers already are to the teaching and practice of architecture and urban planning. The indispensability of capacity to handle large datasets and to manipulate complex models are evident in economic development studies and in studies of education and human development that we project in AKU's future.

The overwhelming case for AKU's being a "fully wired" university has stimulated discussion of the need for it to have programmes of instruction and research in information and computer sciences. This concern has been reinforced by concerns about the need for Pakistan to be more than a user and consumer of products developed elsewhere. The Commission has, however, remained sceptical, recalling parallel questions about statistics and population studies. An AKU weak in either of these fields would be deplorably ill-equipped for its mission. But this does not mean that AKU should have departments of statistics or demography, any more than many other distinguished universities do. AKU will need many competent users of modern information science who are not information specialists. It will no doubt need a few people to guide the acquisition, use, and maintenance of networks and university-wide systems, but this does not mean AKU need enter into formal training programmes for such specialists.

We do recognise that there may be a case in Pakistan and in some other parts of the world of particular interest to AKU for expanded professional education in these fields at home. The celebrated successes of India in software development suggest that there may be attractive

---

niches of comparative advantage in these subjects for developing countries. We have, however, questioned the desirability and feasibility of AKU considering a venture in this field as a somewhat isolated undertaking. The frequent location of departments of computer science in engineering faculties or similar technological contexts reminds us of the lack of such contexts in AKU we are envisaging. The Commission has had some discussion of the desirability of AKU addressing additional needs for technological education, and there were voices in the Karachi faculty and staff so urging. When, however, we came to consider the priority to be given to these subjects we agreed to give higher priority to liberal arts and sciences rather than to further professional education, particularly at first degree level.

The questions of AKU's future in information and computer sciences are certainly complex and may appear differently in the not distant future. We have recommended (in Section VII A above) that a special planning study should be made of AKU's needs in information and communication following on this Commission's efforts. It should address these subjects on a university-wide basis, with its focus on the capacities and competencies needed for AKU's functions in education, research and service. The possible development of instructional programmes in these fields should not be central, but need not be excluded.

### 8.3 *Environment and Resource Studies*

8.3.1 The Commission has, almost from the beginning of its deliberations, debated whether or not it should plan a special component for environmental and resource studies in AKU's future. No one on the Commission has questioned the seriousness of environmental problems in the developing and Muslim worlds. Some of us have followed the work of the (Brundtland) World Commission on Environment and Development in the late 1980s, and the Rio de Janeiro conference on these subjects attracted world-wide attention during the period of the Commission's life. We have latterly, in the person of the newly appointed Acting Rector, had the counsel of an experienced student of environmental problems who is urgently concerned with their seriousness and neglect in Pakistan and other developing countries.

8.3.2 We would not be content with a future AKU that ignored environmental problems. When the Institute of Planning and Management of Human Settlements is initiated, it will be heavily engaged with environmental questions. But AKU will not be neglecting such questions until that Institute appears. A university with a Faculty of Health Sciences that is already deeply involved in community health and starting a programme in health policy and management could hardly ignore the environmental stresses that contribute so heavily to the health problems of Pakistan and other developing countries. We have also been confident that the Institute of Human Development would arouse awareness of the multiple costs of raising children in settings with unsafe drinking water, or unacceptable levels of air pollution. In proposing that AKU establish an Institute of Economic Growth and Society we have made explicit that this Institute would be concerned with "sustainable development" in the sense popularised by the Brundtland Commission and now orthodoxy in the development community. We would hope that this part of AKU would help avoid ultimately disastrous economic policies like the excessive dependence on irrigated agriculture in Central Asia, and also seek ways out of such past errors. In sum, AKU will have through the next decade a widening variety of engagement with environmental questions. It may be objected that they are uneven and likely to be more concerned with urban than with rural areas, but in a world that will have an urban majority by 2030 and in a University that has a special and fateful tie to a Third World metropolis, this may be no bad thing.

8.3.3 Will all this be enough to do justice to the variety and seriousness of environmental questions that now beset the world? That is the question that has stimulated continuing debate. Certainly there are important subjects like global changes that would not come within the agendas of the parts of the future AKU we have named. The staffing of a unit devoted frontally to environmental questions would undoubtedly involve professional competencies that a more dispersed assault on those questions would lack. There is thus unquestionably merit on both sides of this debate, but on balance the Commission has concluded that it should not extend an already very demanding array of new developments in AKU to give further assurance that it will deal with the environmental problems of the developing and Muslim worlds.